Demographic Change and White Flight in Rural America:
Exploiting Minority Labor and Segregating Public Schools in Garden City, KS

by

Michael J. Volk

A Dissertation Presented in Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Education

Approved April 2011 by the
Graduate Supervisory Committee:

Gene V Glass, Chair
Arnold Danzig
Lynn Davey

ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY

August 2011
ABSTRACT

“White flight” is a sociological phenomenon where White members depart urban neighborhoods or schools predominantly populated by minorities, and move to places like suburbs or commuter towns. A huge limitation in White flight research does not account for communities in rural America. The rural community of Garden City, Kansas, is of particular interest because of its shift in demographics over the years. Garden City has transformed dramatically with the arrival of immigrants to staff meatpacking plants and their children who attend the Garden City Public School District. In the last eighteen years, the Garden City Public School District has experienced a 204% growth in Hispanic student enrollment while simultaneously experiencing a 54% decline in White student enrollment. The exodus of White students from the Garden City Public School District is the focus of this research. The findings of this study indicate that White flight exists in the Garden City Public School District primarily as a product of racism due to White community constituents’ feelings of xenophobia and ethnophobia toward Garden City’s minority populations.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Thanks to Gene V Glass for his dedication and guidance throughout this project.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES................................................................................................................. v

LIST OF FIGURES .............................................................................................................. vi

INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................................................... 1

Setting the Foundation .......................................................................................................... 3

Significance of the Study ....................................................................................................... 10

Research Questions ............................................................................................................. 11

LITERATURE REVIEW .......................................................................................................... 12

Civil Rights and Segregation ............................................................................................... 12

Coleman and Segregation .................................................................................................... 13

Orfield and Segregation ........................................................................................................ 16

School Choice and Segregation ........................................................................................... 18

Declining Social Capital and Segregation ........................................................................... 19

METHODOLOGY ................................................................................................................... 22

Research Design and Procedures ......................................................................................... 22

Data Collection .................................................................................................................... 24

FINDINGS ............................................................................................................................... 25

At First Sight .......................................................................................................................... 27

An Online Perspective of Garden City .................................................................................. 29

White Flight and Enrollment Data ....................................................................................... 35

Garden City Confronts New Found Diversity ........................................................................ 37

White Flight and Online Forums .......................................................................................... 42
Page

White Flight and Garden City Interviews ........................................... 48

CONCLUSION .................................................................................. 51

Lies and Hushed Innuendoes ............................................................. 53

The Demise of America ................................................................. 56

The Future of Public Education in Garden City and the Nation .......... 58

REFERENCES .................................................................................. 61

APPENDIX

A INTERVIEW #2 .............................................................................. 66

B SOCIAL BEHAVIORAL APPLICATION HUMAN SUBJECTS........ 76

C PHOTOGRAPHS OF GARDEN CITY ........................................... 87
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2. Why would anyone want to live in Garden City?</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Moving from Chicago to Garden City, Kansas</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Moving to Garden City</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Garden City Enrollment by Year, Race and Gender</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Garden City - Virtual Online Schooling for High School students</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Are White People Fleeing Garden City, KS? City-Data.com</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Are White People Fleeing Garden City, KS? Topix.com</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF EXHIBITS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exhibit</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Race/Ethnicity of Garden City District to State</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Races in Holcomb &amp; GC</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Brookover Feedyard, Garden City, Kansas</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Garden City USD 457 School District</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Garden City’s Social Capital Relative to the State Average</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. 2008 Presidential Election Results in Finney County Kansas</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Tyson Finney County Kansas Plant</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. “Eat Beef” license plate</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Tyson “Help Wanted” Sign</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1

Introduction

Does society owe a significant debt to the progressive advancement of history? Perhaps this is debatable given the status quo of unremitting Anglo ethnocentrism, corporate fascism and the exploitation of cheap labor, and unfettered neoliberalism that defines the political economic paradigm of our time and results in untenable demographic changes in the United States. According to McChesney (1999), fascism is just capitalism with the gloves off. Additionally, neoliberalism dominates nearly every facet of social, political, and economic policy in America. The natural byproduct of neoliberalism is a depoliticized citizenry marked by apathy and cynicism. U.S. residents are ill-equipped, ignorant, or simply indifferent to their own depoliticized citizenry. In fact, many Americans, Anglos particularly, feel so secure in their pre-manufactured comfort zones that they continue to live with as little uncertainty as their illusion can afford. Perhaps the masses need to reevaluate their own smug self-image in the grand scheme of their responsibility in this country or Adam Smith (1759), the father of modern economics, is correct when he argues that the invisible hand was created only to satisfy one’s own self-interests. Researchers must continually expose this contrived illusion and reveal the stark reality behind it. Otherwise, an archaic demographic manifestation will continue to be responsible for the most unsettling inequities and inequalities in the United States public education system since Brown v. Board of Education.
Unfortunately, the never-ending struggle for social justice and democracy in America continues. The age of Reagan gave way to a conservative counterrevolution in what many see as a reversal to the Civil Rights Movement of the 1960s. Exacerbating this phenomenon is the most rapid demographic change in America’s history. Gary Orfield, UCLA Professor of Education, Law, Political Science and Urban Planning and co-founder of The Civil Rights Project, the nation’s leading research center on issues of civil rights and racial inequality, suggests:

The United States is a vast nation of enormous diversity that is undergoing revolutionary demographic changes that are certain to change its society and its institutions in many ways, some predictable, and others deeply dependent upon decisions to come and upon the ability of a creative country with fragmented and complex institutions and enduring prejudices to successfully adapt...How it will function and will react to the most rapid change in its history is very much an open question. (Grant-Thomas & Orfield, 2009, p. 287)

The United States continuously struggles to move toward the future while simultaneously fighting to let go of the past. Often, the present looks entirely too much like the past. A shameful resegregation of schools and communities, especially those in less affluent areas, appears to be a popular trend occurring again, nearly sixty years after it was declared to be illegal by the U.S. Supreme Court.

One significant factor responsible for demographic change in America is the dispersion of ethnic populations from a specific demographic area. In one of its forms, this dispersion is known as White flight. White flight is a sociologic and demographic phenomenon denoting a trend in which white people flee
desegregated urban communities, and move to other places such as suburbs or commuter towns. This Anglo deurbanization is a considerable factor in population shift and demographic change initially, and especially over time. Over the years, a plethora of social science research has focused on White flight from urban communities. In fact, much of the research on White flight comes from two of the most prominent social science researchers: James Coleman (1966, 1975, 1976) and Gary Orfield (1978, 1993, 1999). A significant gap in the present body of research does not account for White flight in rural America. In fact, the definition of White flight clearly states that the focus of White flight only accounts for those who flee urban communities. The rural, Middle American community of Garden City, Kansas, poses a research opportunity of interest because of its shift in demographics over the past 25 years. Not surprisingly, factors responsible for this population shift and demographic change go much deeper than first impressions suggest.

**Setting the Foundation**

Socio-economic and socio-political reforms and policies in not just Kansas, but also in the United States government, have changed the landscape of this Middle American rural community. Thomas Frank (2005) in *What’s the Matter with Kansas? How Conservatives Won the Heart of America* suggests, “People getting their fundamental interests wrong is what American political life is all about” (p. 1). In Kansas, this is exactly what happened. The once majority
Democratic electorate in Kansas is now the minority, whereas the Republican electorate is now a strong majority. Frank argues that working-class people, those who make up the majority in Kansas, vote Republican as a form of derangement. These Kansans are enticed into voting against their best economic interests by “values” issues such as abortion and gay rights, both of which obviously have religious implications. Republicans, many of whom are funded by extremely rich and powerful distant corporations, manipulate the religious sensibilities of the working class. This results in major social and economic inequalities for the working class electorate in Kansas.

Frank (2005) contends:

Out here the gravity of discontent pulls in only one direction: to the right, to the right, further to the right. Strip today’s Kansans of their job security, and they head out to become registered Republicans. Push them off their land, and next thing you know they’re protesting in front of abortion clinics. Squander their life savings on manicures for the CEO, and there’s a good chance they’ll join the John Birch Society. But ask them about the remedies their ancestors proposed (unions, antitrust, public ownership), and you might as well be referring to the days when knighthood was in flower. (p. 65)

As the liberal to conservative political transformation was occurring among the working class electorate in Kansas in the 1980s and 1990s, neoliberalism was becoming the popular political philosophy in America. With Ronald Reagan becoming president of the United States in 1980, Joel Bakan (2004) in The Corporation: The Pathological Pursuit of Profit and Power asserts, “Over the next two decades, governments pursued neoliberalism’s core policies of deregulation, privatization, spending cuts, and inflation reduction with increasing
vigor. By the early 1990s, neoliberalism had become an economic orthodoxy” (p. 21). Thus, the stage was set for the dramatic demographic shift that was about to occur in Garden City.

The most significant demographic change in Garden City has been labeled by many as White flight. The one time Anglo majority in Garden City is now the town’s minority, while the one time Hispanic minority is now the town’s majority. This situation raises the question, “What forces are behind this significant demographic change?” After all, Garden City is a small rural town located on the high plains of southwest Kansas, an hour away by car from any reasonably populated area. Interestingly, according to the Kansas State Historical Society (1902), “it was on the plains of southwest Kansas where the last and hardest battles were fought between the Anglo-Saxon and the red men” (p. 92). Centuries later, unbeknownst to the vast majority, there is another battle raging in southwest Kansas. Although this battle is not fought as in the past, the similarity between the two periods is uncanny. Although conservatism and neoliberalism set the stage for demographic change in Garden City, other forces exacerbated this sociological phenomenon over the last thirty years.

Since 1980, the introduction of meatpacking plants affected southwest Kansas communities, especially Garden City, attracting newcomers from diverse origins (Benson, 1996). The majority of meatpacking plant workers are immigrants; because of the unpleasant working conditions, many U.S. nationals are either not interested in or are unwilling to take meatpacking jobs. The work is
hard and often dangerous. Moreover, meatpacking plant managers are responsible for the increase in the immigrant working population because of their deliberate recruitment of these workers in Mexico. Meatpacking plant managers advertised in Mexico and traveled to Mexico to ship undocumented immigrant workers back to the factories by the busload.

In “Meatpacking and the transformation of rural communities: A comparison of Brooks, Alberta and Garden City, Kansas,” Broadway (2007) eloquently structures the forces behind the demographic transformation of Garden City, KS:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1 Broadway’s (2007) Analysis of Garden City, KS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Structural Change in North American Beefpacking** | • Attributed to a series of cost-cutting innovations  
• Instead of locating it at a railroad terminal site, it was constructed in a cattle producing region  
• Reduced shrinkage and bruising associated with shipping cattle long distances  
• Company purchased cattle directly from producers, thereby eliminating stockyard middlemen  
• Introduced boxed beef: Smaller, vacuum-packed cuts |
| **Meatpacking, Immigrants and Working Conditions** | • In the early 1900s meatpackers attempted to increase productivity by lowering wages and increasing output  
• Replaced skilled butchers with unskilled workers  
• Companies prefer hiring immigrants from many different countries to hamper communication between workers  
• Packinghouse work remains labor intensive and dangerous, which makes line work unattractive to most North Americans  
• Work requires no preexisting job skills or |
• Knowledge of English
  • Old plants’ work varied between hog and cattle slaughter, and workers split their time between the kill floor and processing
  • Modern plants slaughter a single species, and most line workers now stand shoulder-to-shoulder making the same cuts over and over with the result that repetitive motion injuries are commonplace
  • Low wages and an unpleasant work environment contribute to high employee turnover

Packers and Boomtowns

• Rural sociologists studying North American energy boomtowns in the 1970s noted sudden population growth was accompanied by increases in a variety of social disorders
  • Sudden population growth was found to lead to a breakdown in local services
  • Among the first problems to appear is a housing shortage, which sparks an increase in rents and home prices
  • Medical care providers, schools, and law enforcement complain of increasing service demands that lag behind increases in the local tax base
  • Pre-boom communities are characterized by social cohesion and stability
  • Sudden influx of persons is presumed to reduce this cohesion, lowering social interaction and watchfulness, while anonymity and social disorder increase
  • Social isolation has been identified as a key variable in explaining child abuse and neglect among boomtown newcomer families
  • Lower level of support is exacerbated by high levels of residential mobility, which is endemic to boomtowns, but which also reduces watchfulness and surveillance
  • High level of transience among young adult single males is a factor behind increases in boomtowns’ rates of substance abuse
  • Preventing abuse is hampered by high turnover, which also facilitates drug
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study Site: Garden City, KS</th>
<th>trafficking and makes enforcement difficult</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Early European settlers were drawn to the region by the prospect of farming</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rainfall averages less than 18 inches a year, and occasional droughts make farming a risky business, so ranchers turned to raising cattle</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irrigation transformed the community, as it enabled improved pastureland and feed grains to support a cattle-feeding industry</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adoption of deep-well turbine prirps and center-pivot irrigation systems in the 1960s allowed southwestern Kansas farmers to access the vast underground water resources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By 1980 two million cattle were being &quot;finished&quot; within a 150-mile radius of Garden City</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In 1980, Garden City was predominantly Anglo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>That would change with the opening of IBP's 10 miles west of town in the small hamlet of Holcomb in December 1980</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three years later, a beef pro-owned by ConAgra opened on Garden City's eastern edge</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Together these plants would employ about 5,000 workers in a sparsely populated region with little surplus labor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Labor Recruitment</th>
<th>Packing companies have a publicly stated policy of recruiting workers locally</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Before plants opened, average unemployment in surrounding Finney county amounted to just 400</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plant required over 2,000 persons for it to be fully operational</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employee turnover exceeded 100 percent in 1990</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBP recruiters traveled as far as Alabama, New Mexico, and Texas to recruit workers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBP attracted a SE Asian labor force from Wichita, 200 miles east of Garden City</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once this source was exhausted, packers turned to Mexicans</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IBP recruited in borderland cities by</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
advertising on radio stations heard in Mexico

- Hispanics increased from 25 percent in 1990 to 44 percent in 2000, while non-Hispanic whites declined from 68.7 to 49.8 percent
- Today, Garden City holds a Hispanic majority population

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Changes</th>
<th>Economic Changes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Over 12,000 non-farm jobs were created</td>
<td>• Over 12,000 non-farm jobs were created between 1979 and 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>between 1979 and 2000</td>
<td>• 5,000 jobs were created in meatpacking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 5,000 jobs were created in meatpacking</td>
<td>• These newly created jobs sometimes provided only part-time employment and pay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• These newly created jobs sometimes</td>
<td>poorly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provided only part-time employment and</td>
<td>• The number of persons living in poverty rose from 8.5 percent of Garden City’s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pay poorly</td>
<td>population in 1980 to 14.3 percent in 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The number of persons living in poverty</td>
<td>• In 2005 over 62 percent of Garden City public school students received free or</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rose from 8.5 percent of Garden City’s</td>
<td>reduced priced lunches, a number that has risen inexorably</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>population in 1980 to 14.3 percent in</td>
<td>• Rising poverty also meant an increase in the demand for supplementary services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>such as food assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In 2005 over 62 percent of Garden City</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>public school students received free or</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reduced priced lunches, a number that</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>has risen inexorably</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Rising poverty also meant an increase</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in the demand for supplementary services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>such as food assistance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Changes</th>
<th>Social Changes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The population growth produced housing</td>
<td>• The population growth produced housing shortages and rising social service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>shortages and rising social service</td>
<td>demands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>demands</td>
<td>• Garden City's housing shortage in the early 1980s was solved by rezoning land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Garden City's housing shortage in the</td>
<td>for the construction of a mobile home park</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>early 1980s was solved by rezoning land</td>
<td>• In the decade following the opening of its two meatpacking plants, enrollment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>for the construction of a mobile home</td>
<td>in Garden City's schools increased by over a third</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>park</td>
<td>• In the early 1980s, with the influx of Southeast Asians, local funds were raised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In the decade following the opening of</td>
<td>to support an English as a Second Language (ESL) summer camp for Southeast Asian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>its two meatpacking plants, enrollment</td>
<td>children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in Garden City's schools increased by</td>
<td>• Over a third of the school district's teachers enrolled in classes to learn</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>over a third</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• In the early 1980s, with the influx of</td>
<td>• Crime rate rose steadily during the early 1990s before peaking in 1994 and falling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Southeast Asians, local funds were</td>
<td>to its lowest level in a decade in 1997 and then rising again</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>raised to support an English as a Second</td>
<td>• Number of arrests rose by over a third during the 1990 to 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language (ESL) summer camp for Southeast</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Between 1980 and 1985 the rate of confirmed cases of child abuse and neglect tripled in Finney County
• Meatpacking industry has a six-month eligibility criterion for health care benefits
• Throughout the 1980s and 1990s, Finney County continued to rank in the worst 10 percent of Kansas counties for children lacking immunization, teen pregnancies, and lack of prenatal care

Obviously, population shifts arise because of this deliberate attempt to recruit and exploit cheap labor. According to the Garden City data for school enrollment over the years, there is a significant increase in refugees and immigrants from Latin America, Asia, and Africa. Interestingly, while this minority population increased, school enrollment figures for the White population declined considerably (Kansas State Department of Education Statistics, 2011). That decrease and the reasons for it are the focus of the research presented here.

Significance of the Study

Understanding White flight in rural America is significant, overlooked, and under-researched. After all, the Midwest is considered by many to embody the essence of America. There the economy was traditionally agricultural, hard work was to be rewarded with the American dream, and traditional values were expected, embraced, and taught. However, in the last thirty years the idea of the American dream has wrapped itself in a mantle that preaches that only hard work brings success, an ideology repeated time and time again in the public media. Often, the media are used as an instrument to shape public opinion and to elicit
support for the corporate agenda. Many actors have contributed to the
demographic change and White flight in Garden City, and this sociological
phenomenon is profound.

**Research Questions**

Garden City and the invisible hand that controls it have many secrets to
tell and many actors responsible for the screenplay that is about to unfold. The
primary research question guiding this study is simple: What happens to schools
in a rural American town when a community’s ethnic and racial demographics
suddenly change? The purpose of this study is not to test any theories or
hypotheses; it is simply to answer questions. In order to address the more general
question above, the following more specific research questions will be addressed:
What are the perspectives of a select sample of school-community stakeholders
on demographic change in their community? Additionally, what is the impact of
these demographic shifts on education opportunities for community constituents?
Chapter 2

Literature Review

A younger minority population, predominately Hispanic, has transformed Garden City, Kansas, an established Anglo, close-knit, rural community. When a community has a drastic population shift in a closed demographic area, especially in the beginning years, feelings of xenophobia often arise among the established majority. Implications for such drastic population shifts and demographic change might be best understood by examining the body of literature that pertains to segregation and White flight from public schools.

Civil Rights and Segregation

*Plessy v. Ferguson*, a landmark United States Supreme Court decision in 1896, upheld the constitutionality of state laws requiring racial segregation under the doctrine of “separate but equal.” Significant racial differences in education funding emerged immediately following the landmark decision. States instantly adopted oppressive legislation that typically provided facilities and institutions to African Americans that were far inferior to those provided to the Anglo population. The “separate but equal” doctrine was clearly a failure until 1954 when the doctrine was overturned in the Supreme Court decision of *Brown v. Board of Education* of Topeka, Kansas. It turned out separate was, in fact, not equal. Years of litigation occurred in most states across the nation. Rather than force integration, however, many states repealed compulsory attendance laws to
allow parents freedom to choose where to send their children for schooling.

James Coleman initially identified education quality and inequality in U.S. schooling in *The Adolescent Society* published in 1961. Few knew at that time the effect Coleman would have on education equality in the United States.

With the passage of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, the United States outlawed major forms of discrimination against blacks and women and attempted to end racial segregation throughout the country. However, integration moved slowly and was nearly nonexistent in some states. Like many forms of social experiments throughout the years, primarily out of fear and uncertainty, states and school districts waited to see how others would respond to integration attempts. James S. Coleman, Ernest Q. Campbell, Carol J. Hobson, James Mcpartland, Alexander M. Mood, Frederic D. Weinfeld, and Robert L. York (1966), being directed by the 1964 Civil Rights Act, formed a research team that was responsible for looking at public education for the purpose of, “determining the availability of equal educational opportunities in the public schools for minority group; Negroes, Puerto Ricans, Mexican-Americans, Oriental-Americans, and American Indians, as compared with opportunities for majority group; Whites” (p. Report Résumé).

**Coleman and Segregation**

The Equality of Educational Opportunity Study, commonly referred to as *The Coleman Report*, documented segregation still prevalent in American schools
Despite the *Brown v. Board of Education* ruling twelve years prior. Coleman (1966) found that the majority of students attended schools that are segregated. Despite the slow pace at which the country tried to implement desegregation plans, Coleman and his team identified several factors that showed signs of impacting student achievement. First, socioeconomic factors influenced student achievement. Second, positive school conditions were found to impact the lowest achieving minority students more than white student achievement. Third, quality teachers resulted in the largest increase in minority student achievement. The report also identified that the “achievement gap” that many minority students experience early in their education will remain with them through their entire school experience.

Coleman (1975) conducted a follow-up study to *The Coleman Report* where he identified recent trends of integration and some of its consequences. He noted that desegregation practices conducted by school districts across the country resulted in, “white parents moving from a school district in which the contact between blacks and whites is great to a school district in which it is small—usually from a city system where there is a high proportion of minority children to a suburban system which there is a low proportion” (1975, p.3). In 1968, African Americans attended school with 74% other African Americans while Anglo students attended school with 93% Anglo students. Fortunately, by 1972 segregation among schools in the U.S. dropped from 72% in 1968 to 56% in 1972. Coleman found that small districts experienced the most rapid
desegregation changes across America. Larger districts, on the other hand, predominately those in urban areas, still saw significant segregation among schools within their district.

Coleman (1975) made a final analysis in his follow-up study to *The Coleman Report*. Coleman contended that there is a population movement of Anglo citizens, specifically middle class, to the suburbs. He did note, however, that Anglo citizens began moving from urban cities before school desegregation. Although Anglo deurbanization predates desegregation, public school desegregation did contribute to the flight of Anglo middle class populations from urban areas. In fact, Coleman suggested that it created a compounding effect on what was taking place in large cities. Coleman concluded that although Anglos fled integration in middle-sized cities, it occurred most prominently in large urban cities. Interestingly, Coleman does not identify the sociological phenomenon as White flight, which was commonly used to explain middle class, Anglo suburbanization that took place after World War II (Rossell & Hawley, 1982).

In a presentation at the ATA School of Excellence in New York City, Coleman (1976) presented his finding on the effects of school desegregation and the loss of Anglos due to desegregation. Again, Coleman outlined that desegregation efforts in large central city districts have contributed to the movement of Anglo students to the suburbs. Analyses found a strong relationship between black enrollment in urban public schools and White flight. Coleman’s most controversial work on this topic found that mandatory school desegregation
plans tended to accelerate residential moves by Anglos away from central cities, thereby contributing to resegregation (Marsden, 2005). Additionally, research found that increases in between-district segregation due to residential movements countered within-district declines in segregation due to government policy (Coleman, Kelly, & Moore, 1975).

**Orfield and Segregation**

Gary Orfield is a widely regarded scholar on studies of desegregation. Orfield is professor of education, law, political science, and urban planning at UCLA. He was professor of education and social policy at the Harvard University where he co-founded and co-directed the Civil Rights Project before moving it to UCLA in 2007. The Civil Rights Project of Harvard University followed Coleman’s research but approached it differently by looking at different data sets rather than surveys. Orfield used data sets from the US Department of Education Common Core of Data Public School Universe for his studies on segregation in the United States. In Orfield’s (1993, 1999) studies, he found that students of color are more likely to be segregated into schools of poverty due to the strong correlation between race and poverty (Orfield, Schley, Glass, & Reardon, 1993). Like Coleman, Orfield found the highest degree of segregation is found in mid-size to large metropolitan cities. Unlike urban areas, integration was found to progress faster in rural and small locales. With the large influx of Hispanics in the United States, Orfield was able to study this population on a
much larger scale than Coleman ever had a chance to do. Orfield found that Hispanics are least segregated in the Midwest. The reason behind this is most likely because schools in the Midwest are often remote and many towns only contain one public school. Thus, integration occurs because no other viable education options exist. This does not appear to be the case in Garden City.

Orfield’s (1993, 1999) studies starkly contrast Coleman’s (1975, 1976) studies on segregation, desegregation, and resegregation. Orfield argued that White flight was not caused by desegregation as Coleman suggested. Orfield, Schley, Glass, and Reardon (1993) argued, “The underlying reality, of course, was a dramatic drop in the number of school age white children in the U.S., as the white birth rate fell and the white population aged” (p. 13). Additionally, Orfield et al. (1993), suggested “Desegregation has certainly not produced white abandonment of the public schools, though it has doubtless had impacts on enrollment trends in some districts” (p. 13). Weakening desegregation efforts, Miliken v. Bradley, 418 U.S. 717 (1974) limited such efforts to single districts. This allowed middle class Anglo students and families to choose another district that was more demographically pleasing, allowing for self-segregation.

Fortunately, Orfield and Yun (1999), in a follow up to Orfield’s study in 1993, finally focused on the growing Hispanic population in the resegregation of public schools in America. The data in this study show increasing segregation for Hispanic students who are becoming the largest minority group in the United States. Orfield and Yun (1999) found that Hispanics have been, in fact, more
segregated than African Americans in recent years. Not surprisingly, the most serious segregation occurs within the nation’s largest metropolitan areas. Orfield and Yun (1999) contend, “All racial groups except whites experience considerable diversity in their schools but whites are remaining in overwhelmingly white schools even in regions with very large non-white enrollments” (p. 3). In other words, Anglo students are the only racial group that attends schools where the majority of the other students enrolled are of their own race.

**School Choice and Segregation**

The current political popularity of charter schools, which encompasses virtual and online schooling, is unmistakable. In a landmark research study focusing on the extent to which charter school students are segregated, Erica Frankenberg, Genevieve Siegel-Hawley, and Jia Wang in “Choice without equity: Charter school segregation” (2011) argue that charter schools currently isolate students by race and class. Charter school advocates have long held that charters improve student outcomes through the introduction of free market competition in the public school system. According to Frankenberg, Siegel-Hawley, and Wang, “Fifty-five years after the landmark U.S. Supreme Court decision in Brown v. Board of Education, segregation remains durably linked to limited opportunities and a lack of preparation for students of all races to live and work in a diverse society” (p. 3).
Frankenberg, Siegel-Hawley, and Wang (2011) analyzed three data sources: the 2007–08 Common Core of Data (CCD), the 2006 Civil Rights Data Collection (CRDC), and the 2007–08 Schools and Staffing Survey (SASS). Their study suggests “Sorting students by socioeconomic status is linked to charters, as well as a propensity for charter schools to serve lower numbers of ELLs and students with disabilities” (2011, p. 13). In other words, charter schools educate a set of students stratified along dimensions of race, class, and language. All politicians, despite their ideological viewpoint, argue that child’s demographic residence should not determine their ability to access educational opportunity. However, this appears to be exactly what is happening in charter schools. In fact, charters may appear to act as havens for White flight. Renzulli and Evans in “School choice, charter schools, and White flight” (2005) argue “whites who attend schools with nonwhites continue to look for options that are even more white” (p. 16).

**Declining Social Capital and Segregation**

One possible explanation for the rapid demographic change in America, the continuation of White flight, and the resegregation of public schools that isolate students by race and class, is America’s declining social capital. In 1995, Robert D. Putnam published a journal article that gained him academic celebrity status. In “Bowling Alone: America's Declining Social Capital” (1995), Putnam presents his argument that civic society and democracy in America is declining at
a rapid rate ever since the 1970s. Of particular interest, Putnam makes reference in his section “Other demographic transformations,” much of which focuses on economics as a component to civic disengagement:

The changes in scale that have swept over the American economy in these years—illustrated by the replacement of the corner grocery by the supermarket and now perhaps of the supermarket by electronic shopping at home, or the replacement of community-based enterprises by outposts of distant multinational firms—may perhaps have undermined the material and even physical basis for civic engagement. (Putnam, 1995, p. 9).

In the 1980s, President Ronald Regan preached to Americans that as consumers, it is our responsibility to stimulate the economy in order to promote growth and well-being. In order to consume, one needs money, or at least borrowed money. Consequently, more jobs, longer hours, and more women in the workforce contributed to stimulating the economy, but also, more darkly, satisfying one’s growing material self-interests. In turn, one’s hyper-working and hyper-consuming contributed to the overall lack of civic engagement, not only among neighborhoods, but also across all levels of society.

In 2000, Putnam, in a book-length expansion of his original argument, published *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*. Putnam (2000) contends, “Weakened social capital is manifest in the things that have vanished almost unnoticed - neighborhood parties and get-togethers with friends, the unreflective kindness of strangers, the shared pursuit of the public good rather than a solitary quest for private goods” (p. 403). However, beyond just an individual quest for private goods is possibly the most important point
Putnam makes in his analysis: what Putnam refers to as “bonding” rather than “bridging” social capital.

Putnam contends that bonding social capital solidifies links within groups, whereas bridging social capital builds links between groups. According to Putnam:

Of all the dimensions along which forms of social capital vary, perhaps most important is the distinction between bridging (or inclusive) and bonding (or exclusive). Some forms of social capital are, by choice or necessity, inward looking and tend to reinforce exclusive identities and homogenous groups…Other networks are outward looking and encompass people across diverse social cleavages. (2000, p. 22)

In other words, bonding social capital most notably occurs when citizens are socializing with people of their same age, ethnicity, socio-economic class, religion, ideological viewpoint, etc. Bridging social capital, on the other hand, occurs when citizens positively and constructively engage with members of society who are unlike them. America, now more than ever, is a diverse, multi-ethnic country. Bridging is one of the greatest struggles facing Americans today. Buttressing ethnophobia and xenophobia is unlikely to promote bridging any time in the near future. This will likely continue to promote rapid demographic change in America, the continuation of White flight, and resegregation of public education. In sum, “Bridging social capital can generate broader identities and reciprocity, whereas bonding social capital bolsters our narrower selves” (Putnam, 2000, p. 23).
Chapter 3

Methods

To begin to understand White flight in Garden City, Kansas, a mixed-methods study will be conducted and findings analyzed. Prior research on White flight most often used U.S. Census data and other forms of quantitative data to make broad generalizations about large metropolitan school districts. Consequently, there is an absence of qualitative studies in research when looking at White flight. In this study, however, both qualitative and quantitative methods will be used. The nature of qualitative research lends itself to debatable interpretations. Although this is the reality of the case study method, every effort is utilized to make clear, concise interpretations based on the best data at hand (Stake, 1995).

A sociological phenomenon is occurring in Garden City that demands answers. Many complex variables come into play when considering this phenomenon. The majority of research studies dealing with White flight and migratory dispersion are based largely on quantitative data. This phenomenon, however, begs for a case study methodology.

Research Design and Procedure

The research structure for this qualitative mini-study is a guided, semi-structured, open-ended interview platform patterned after the in-depth, phenomenological-based interview (Seidman, 2006). The 60-minute interview
includes the interviewee’s life history, details of experience, and reflection of meaning (Seidman, 2006). Using a thematic approach for data analysis of transcripts (Rossman & Rallis, 2003; Seidman, 2006), excerpts of transcripts are coded into various categories called themes. Ultimately, thematic elements are put them into a “holistic, contextualized analysis” (Rossman and Rallis, 2003, p. 274).

Interviews will be conducted and interpreted. Open-ended questions will be asked to participants to provide a depth of knowledge on the phenomenon in question. Research participants are located out-of-state from the researcher. Consequently, the mode of communication will often occur over the telephone. These interviews will be seen as a conversation between the researcher, or interviewer, and the research participant, or interviewee, in order to gather participants’ views and experiences regarding the research topic. Open-ended follow-up questions are asked in order for participants to be clearer in responses, or to elaborate on their answers. Interviews will be conducted with participants in Garden City, Kansas. These community constituents are familiar with the community and are knowledgeable stakeholders of education in Garden City.

One open-ended question of significant interest to ask stakeholders is: “What does demographic change look like in your community?” Additionally, “What is the impact of this demographic shift on education in your community?” After the analysis of interviews is complete, the goal is to construct an “emic” perspective from the words and perspectives of the participants in order to
understand the shift in demographics, what exactly demographic change in Garden City looks like, and how it is experienced. Ultimately, it will be essential to give a fair and accurate assessment of White flight in Garden City, Kansas, based on sound qualitative research in order to understand White flight and its related phenomena of segregation, education equality, and social justice within the community.

**Data Collection**

In addition to the qualitative approach of conducting interviews, a variety of data sources will be used including data from the United State Census Bureau, newspaper articles, school enrollment data, and online forums and blogs. Online forums provide valuable research data since motives may more openly show themselves protected by the veil of anonymity. When participants are completely unaware that they are being used as instruments of research, an espousal of true feelings and blunt and uninhibited responses allows a researcher to gain an even more accurate representation of the racial feelings of a small, rural town as it experiences rapid ethnic population shifts.

Although there may be no immediate benefit to the participants, they will be sharing their valuable perspectives while contributing to social science research. Consequently, this will allow the researcher to construct a complex narrative of demographic change and White flight.
Chapter 4

Findings

As Coleman and Orfield suggest, the highest degree of segregation occurs in mid-size to large metropolitan cities and unlike urban areas, integration progresses faster in rural and small locales. This does not appear to be the case in the Garden City School District. Finney County consists of two public school districts, Garden City - USD 457 and Holcomb - USD 363, respectively. There is only one public high school in Garden City and only one ten miles away in Holcomb. According to Kansas Department of Education statistics, White student enrollment in the Garden City School District makes up
only 25.35% percent of the student population compared to the State average which shows an average White student enrollment population of 68.91% (see Exhibit 1). In the last eighteen years of enrollment data, as far back as the Kansas Department of Education statistics are available, White student enrollment has declined 54%, while Hispanic student enrollment has grown by 204%. One can no longer overlook or dismiss this decline in White enrollment and growth in Hispanic enrollment.

In Holcomb, Kansas, White student enrollment has remained consistent over the last eighteen years, while Hispanic student enrollment has increased by 150% in the last eighteen years. This seems paradoxical since the two schools are so close in proximity one would assume they serve the same populations of students. Since White enrollment has not increased in Holcomb, it should be safe to deduce that the White student population has not left Garden City High to enroll in Holcomb High, although it is quite interesting that the same trend is not occurring in Holcomb.

It is important to note the racial makeup of Garden City and Holcomb and how this may contribute to enrollment statistics (see Exhibit 2). According to City-Data.com, in July

Exhibit 2: Races in Holcomb & GC. Retrieved November 2010 from City-Data.com
2009, 2,144 residents lived in Holcomb while 28,532 residents lived in Garden City. Before Tyson built a meatpacking plant in Holcomb, the town was nothing more than a few houses and barns. However, since the Tyson plant was built, the town has grown to include housing developments and subdivisions to house a generally more affluent, White population. According to City-Data.com, the median household income and median house value in Holcomb outdistance those of Garden City. This may help to explain why the White flight trend has not caught on in Holcomb.

At First Sight

From the onset, interviewees discussed the dramatic increase in student public school enrollment in the populations of Hispanics, Southeast Asians (Vietnamese refugees and Laotians), Burmese, and most recently, Somalis. Accordingly, they contend the dramatic influx of these populations is a direct result of the populations lured to the community by meatpacking jobs. Prior to the first slaughterhouse opening in

Exhibit 3: Brookover Feedyard, Garden City, Kansas. Photo taken March 2010
1980, the town did have a relatively small Hispanic population. The cash crop a century ago was sugar beets, which brought Hispanics to the community to work the fields, and some stayed in the community.

In the last thirty years, the grains of milo, corn, and alfalfa to feed livestock replaced sugar beets. Since the cash crop changed, wealthy corporations began feeding large numbers of cattle in feedyards (see Exhibit 3), pushing most family farms out of business. Lured by a promising cattle-feeding industry, meatpacking plants soon followed suit. If meatpacking plants could finally stay out of the unrelenting eye of Urban America and buy vast amounts of cheap land in Rural America, they would not think twice about sneaking in unnoticed and doing so. After the appeal of cheap land lured corporations, cheap labor soon followed. Cheap labor brought minority populations to the community, which increased enrollment for these populations of students.

Since immigrant labor working in meatpacking plants are paid so poorly, there was a dramatic increase in the number of families officially living in poverty. Additionally, education was affected because of the spike in so many students of these populations enrolled in free and reduce-priced lunches at school.
Initially, interviewees stated that the community was entirely unprepared for the dramatic influx of the immigrant labor force and the children they brought with them. For example, the implementation and cost of ESL Instruction posed a major challenge to the Garden City School District (see Exhibit 4). In fact, according to one interviewee, church groups provided much of the monies raised for this instruction. Furthermore, the community adopted a “grow our own” program to deal with the difficulty of staffing bilingual education with qualified teachers. Since the emergence of the first beef-packing plant more than thirty years ago, there was an increase in crime, child abuse, and neglect, which continues to manifest itself in Garden City.

An Online Perspective of Garden City

Sometimes it is difficult for an outsider to obtain a fair and accurate account of what a city looks like from an insider’s perspective. An outsider has difficulty being trusted within a community without respect to gender, race, or class, but simply because he or she is an outsider. In small town America, several folks do not like to discuss openly information about their town with outsiders. Generally, if one is lucky enough to gain an insider’s perspective, he or she will share the positive traits the town attributes to itself. After all, who wants to spend time talking negatively about one’s own place of residence? An incredible productive way to look behind the smoke and mirrors is to analyze online forums or blogs (a portmanteau of “web” and “log”) about a specific control group.
These blogs are a valid source for researchers. Garden City, for example, has many blogs about the city itself and the residents who live there.

A blog is a website that allows users to reflect, share opinions, and discuss various topics in the form of an online journal while readers comment on posts. From the outside, anyone can peek into what others’ opinions are on any matter of importance. The Internet allows those who post and respond to blogs a level of anonymity that face-to-face interaction never allows. It is as if people are more blunt or honest because there is no immediate reaction or consequences to either the subject being questioned or the one doing the questioning. According to online blogs, many people have mixed reviews of Garden City. Often, negative reviews outnumber positive reviews. For example, in Table 2, a Topix.com Garden City online forum entitled, “Why would anyone want to live in Garden City?” posts include:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 2</th>
<th>Why would anyone want to live in Garden City?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>jarred</td>
<td>Wichita, KS May 18, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I wouldn't move there. not much of anything fun to do. lots and lots of mexicans... mean people..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>texas is the place to be</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Janna</td>
<td>Ashburn, VA May 19, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I live in Garden City and trust me if I could get out of here, I would. On the other hand...it's not as bad as it's made out to be. Major crime for the most part is no issue. Overall it's a safe place to be, there's just NOTHING to do</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>garden city resident</td>
<td>May 28, 2009</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Garden City, KS</td>
<td>Nov 7, 2009</td>
<td>i have lived in garden city for three years and i hate it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holcomb, KS</td>
<td>Nov 7, 2009</td>
<td>NurseInTown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I wouldn't move here if my life depended on it! I moved here only to be closer to my fiancee who had a better job than me. Since I have been in this county, things have gotten nothing but worse...crime rate has shot UP since Tyson plant welcomed Chicago people in....no one speaks english anymore....walmart is so packed with trash you can't even go there (oh and unless u speak spanish u can't get help)! I am an RN...and I can't even get a decent paying job!!! Imagine what a college kid would earn if an RN can't even pay her bills!!!!!! This entire county is full of trash, and pregnant teenagers!!! This county has the highest prego rate per capita!! wanna know y??/ Because once they have kids, they go on welfare......thanks for funding ignorant underage girls who can't finish high school!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syracuse, KS</td>
<td>Sep 18, 2010</td>
<td>upset and mad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I left a long time ago i wouldn't move back if the paid me to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long gone</td>
<td>Sep 21, 2010</td>
<td>Long gone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Las Vegas, NV</td>
<td>Sep 21, 2010</td>
<td>We left stinky town 20 years ago and found far greener career pastures where we don't breathe fecal matter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A co-worker in our new state was telling me about their cross country journey to our new state. She mentioned driving through a town that was the smelliest place she had ever been and that some fool had the nerve to name the town Garden City. She said they had planned to get a room there but they kept on driving. After I ROFL I told her it was the stink pit that I had moved from.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>If it still stinks so bad the name should be changed to Garden Sh..tty or GagMe, KS as a warning to potential visitors. Surely breathing dried fecal matter is toxic and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
if studies prove me right the place is ripe for a class action lawsuit.


Likewise, in Table 3, a forum sponsored by City-Data.com entitled, “Moving from Chicago to Garden City, Kansas,” a member responded to a question about an individual wanting to move his family to Garden City and stated:

Table 3: City-Data.com Forum Entitled: “Moving from Chicago to Garden City, Kansas.” Data retrieved October 2010 from http://www.city-
In Table 4, further revealing responses regarding blogger’s opinions on the Tyson meatpacking plant and the influx of minority populations in Garden City were found in a 2007 City-Data.com Thread entitled “Moving to Garden City”:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 4 Moving to Garden City</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>byoung57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Join Date: May 2007</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 posts, read 7,317 times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reputation: 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05-27-2007, 08:05 AM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moving to Garden City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My wife and I are seriously considering a move to Garden City as part of the faculty of the college there. We will be moving from North Georgia. I have lived in the south all of my life, so I would appreciate any help on what it is like to live in that area...both positive and negative comments. I am aware of the Hispanic influx, but that does not concern me as we face the same challenges and benefits of that issue here. Thanks for any help you can give.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| chele123                      |
| Huh?                          |
| Join Date: May 2007           |
| Location: SW Kansas           |
| 1,108 posts, read 1,032,777 times |
| Reputation: 491               |
| 05-27-2007, 02:55 PM          |
| Get ready for culture shock! Garden City is flat, windy, and some days the feedlots smell so bad you can't breathe! Other than that, it's not too bad. There's a pretty good hospital there, decent shopping with both Target and Walmart, some specialty stores, some pretty good restaurants and reasonable cost of living. Garden City is either 1. In the Middle of Nowhere, or 2. Centrally located - depending on your point of view. Denver is about 5 hours away, OKC is about 6, Wichita about 4. Nobody talks "miles" here, we measure in "hours"! |

<p>| Torn2pieces                  |
| Misfit On the Run!!          |
| Join Date: Oct 2006          |
| Location: I am no            |
| 05-28-2007, 04:43 AM         |
| Oh Yes, it does stink bad there, doesnt it. I lived in Dodge City which is 50 miles from Garden. I use to be in Garden every other weekend. Personally, I'd never |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Username: Longer Invisible!!!!!</th>
<th>Live there. There's some shopping and some eateries, but that's about it. There's a meat packing plant there, I do believe there use to be 2, one burned down. Yes, there is a big influx of hispanics, usually illegals who work in those plants. Like other towns, there is crime. There's a Zoo in Garden. You can drive through it or walk through it. I've been to it a few times with my lil boy. Some parts are nice and of course you got your dumpy parts. Thats all I can think of right now -</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rating: 6677</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Posts: 4,090</td>
<td>Read: 2,948,485 times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Username: jramirez</th>
<th>08-20-2007, 04:18 PM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rating: 11</td>
<td>HUGE cultural shock! Sorry about the Torn2pieces reply, seemed racist. If people were &quot;illegal&quot; they couldn't get a job at Tyson in the first place. It is not what most people think about the Hispanic population there, that most are &quot;illegals&quot;. I am part of that community and I don't know many people that live here illegally. There is a many crime, but there is crime everywhere, and usually by youth. There is no major tension amongst the different cultural groups, we all seem to get along great. The feedyard located NW in the city gives it a horrible odor, worse when the humidity level is high. And if you are teaching at the community college prepare to work with a great staff. I enjoyed all my teachers there, and the students are prepared to learn.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Member</td>
<td>befriended</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Join Date: Aug 2007</td>
<td>1 posts, read 3,422 times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Username: las9840</th>
<th>04-21-2008, 09:13 AM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rating: 10</td>
<td>There is a large &quot;illegal&quot; hispanic population here, and yes they do work at Tyson, Tyson is doing a lot to cut down on that. I have a friend who was not illegal and he applied for a management position at Tyson and was told he was already employed by Tyson (big shock identity theft). I think the ethenol plant smells about as bad as the feedlot. There are Wal-mart and Target, and Home Depot. I hate to shop in town because the hispanics go shopping in groves and let there children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Member</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Join Date: Mar 2008</td>
<td>2 posts, read 5,328 times</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
run all over the stores unattended. The toy departments are always completely destroyed with items removed from the packaging and discarded on the floor, many of the children unattended are left there to play while the rest of the family shops. The schools are overcrowded because of the hispanics and their huge families, the majority are on free lunches and are rude and disrespectful to adults (I worked in the school for several years before deciding I needed the income less than the abuse by the hispanic students). So you think I'm prejudiced? Not before living here. I have lived in GC 20 years and my husband was born here. We can't wait to leave and never look back. We have the same two or three Mayors who just rotate from city council to Mayor and so on so its just the same government in a continuous circle.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jim West</th>
<th>04-25-2008, 06:37 PM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Member</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Join Date: Apr 2008</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location: No Mans Land</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99 posts, read 172,102 times</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reputation: 60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I moved to my present location from the Garden City/Liberal area. I was involved in the court system there and I can tell you that the population is about 70% Hispanic with about 85% of them being illegals. There are several feedyards surrounding the town and there are 2 packing plants there. The schools are overcrowded with non-english speaking immigrant children, and about 65% of them are from single parent families--latch key children.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MadameAuthor</th>
<th>05-08-2008, 12:28 PM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Junior Member</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Join Date: May 2008</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 posts, read 5,357 times</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reputation: 10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wow... I'm supposed to be relocating to Garden City and that meat packing company got fined heavily for hiring all those illegal aliens so they have been recruiting throughout the US for American citizens to relocated to Garden City. We'll see how I fair out there. God, I hope it doesn't smell that bad!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

White Flight and Enrollment Data

Have White students left the Garden City School District by either moving out of the district or staying put and enrolling in another district?

Quantitatively, the Kansas Department of Education enrollment data (see Table 5)

Table 5:
Garden City District Headcount Enrollment by Year, Race, and Gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SCHOOL YEAR</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>MALE</th>
<th>FEMALE</th>
<th>WHITE</th>
<th>MALE</th>
<th>FEMALE</th>
<th>BLACK</th>
<th>MALE</th>
<th>FEMALE</th>
<th>HISPANIC</th>
<th>MALE</th>
<th>FEMALE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1992-1993</td>
<td>7092</td>
<td>3685</td>
<td>3407</td>
<td>2082</td>
<td>2014</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>1334</td>
<td>1158</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993-1994</td>
<td>7265</td>
<td>3773</td>
<td>3492</td>
<td>2067</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>1420</td>
<td>1260</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994-1995</td>
<td>7303</td>
<td>3762</td>
<td>3541</td>
<td>1943</td>
<td>1904</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>1536</td>
<td>1396</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995-1996</td>
<td>7371</td>
<td>3810</td>
<td>3561</td>
<td>1852</td>
<td>1801</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>1699</td>
<td>1533</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996-1997</td>
<td>7383</td>
<td>3812</td>
<td>3571</td>
<td>1740</td>
<td>1699</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>1828</td>
<td>1644</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997-1998</td>
<td>7538</td>
<td>3844</td>
<td>3694</td>
<td>1692</td>
<td>1659</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1919</td>
<td>1790</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998-1999</td>
<td>7645</td>
<td>3901</td>
<td>3744</td>
<td>1641</td>
<td>1555</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>2044</td>
<td>1942</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999-2000</td>
<td>7780</td>
<td>3964</td>
<td>3816</td>
<td>1555</td>
<td>1525</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>2217</td>
<td>2086</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-2001</td>
<td>7864</td>
<td>4030</td>
<td>3834</td>
<td>1500</td>
<td>1461</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>2330</td>
<td>2177</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001-2002</td>
<td>7801</td>
<td>3969</td>
<td>3832</td>
<td>1436</td>
<td>1392</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>2341</td>
<td>2247</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002-2003</td>
<td>7749</td>
<td>3927</td>
<td>3822</td>
<td>1365</td>
<td>1328</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>2389</td>
<td>2310</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003-2004</td>
<td>7670</td>
<td>3926</td>
<td>3744</td>
<td>1260</td>
<td>1229</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>2330</td>
<td>2158</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-2005</td>
<td>7572</td>
<td>3856</td>
<td>3716</td>
<td>1211</td>
<td>1139</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>2308</td>
<td>2217</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005-2006</td>
<td>7405</td>
<td>3760</td>
<td>3645</td>
<td>1109</td>
<td>1031</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>2270</td>
<td>2191</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006-2007</td>
<td>7391</td>
<td>3770</td>
<td>3621</td>
<td>1032</td>
<td>943</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>2300</td>
<td>2245</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-2008</td>
<td>7311</td>
<td>3699</td>
<td>3612</td>
<td>1019</td>
<td>927</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>2304</td>
<td>2281</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008-2009</td>
<td>7286</td>
<td>3673</td>
<td>3613</td>
<td>974</td>
<td>898</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>2279</td>
<td>2276</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009-2010</td>
<td>7461</td>
<td>3788</td>
<td>3673</td>
<td>987</td>
<td>904</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>2525</td>
<td>2512</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010-2011</td>
<td>7557</td>
<td>3873</td>
<td>3684</td>
<td>968</td>
<td>915</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>2592</td>
<td>2491</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: District Headcount Enrollment by Year, Race, and Gender. Data Retrieved January 2011 from http://svapp15586.ksde.org/k12/CountyStatics.aspx?org_no=D045

speaks very plainly to the affirmative, although at first sight it is unclear why or where students are going. According to the quantitative data of county headcount enrollment by year, race, and gender, it is obvious that enrollment in the district has increased over the last 18 years—the farthest back the online research data
reaches. Although overall student enrollment has increased, the Anglo student population has declined 54% while the Hispanic student population has grown 204%. These white students are going somewhere. The possible options that immediately come to mind include enrollment in private, for-profit charter and/or online virtual schools, homeschooling, or the possibility that Anglo families are packing up and leaving the town of Garden City altogether. Initially, all options seem possible and all offer and reveal some truth behind the statistics. Unfortunately, enrollment data on homeschooling and online virtual schooling does not come under the same strict publication rules as public school enrollment. Consequently, depending on who was interviewed, enrollment data on homeschooling and virtual schooling varied, but nonetheless definitely existed and had a significant effect on White flight from the Garden City School District.

It would be easy to draw one simple manufactured theme to describe why White enrollment has decreased in the Garden City School District. Although most politicians prefer this one-size-fits-all answer to explain policy matters, complexity regarding such issues is often either ignored or conveniently overlooked. The complex variables regarding this research study are no different and thus, a simple answer to the research question does not exist.

Garden City Confronts New Found Diversity

One interesting interpretation of all research read is that the media casts Garden City as a “city upon a hill” with how great it has embraced diversity and
multiculturalism. Although it is not fair merely to gainsay all the efforts the district and community have made to achieve education equity, it is important to analyze the source and meaning of those claims. For example, Garden City made CNN headlines in 2009 when Whites finally became the minority in the community. When asked, “How do you all get along,” Tim Cruz, former mayor of Garden City, Kansas, stated, “It’s just another melting pot you know.” “It makes it nice to have those different cultures. And sure they’re different – we have to understand what they celebrate and why they do it” (Callebs, 2009, p. 1).

However, a much different perspective was viewed in “Social capital in Kansas: The Garden City case study,” where Dziadkowiec and McMurtry (2009) interviewed many Garden City community members and contend, “Despite the area’s diversity, the community has struggled with issues of racial intolerance and exploitative practices targeted at the Hispanic community” (p. 3). In fact, according to Dziadkowiec and McMurty’s research, much more needs to be done to increase social capital in Garden City (see Exhibit 5).

One significant factor contributing to a decline in White enrollment is the presence and push for virtual schooling in Kansas, a school choice movement largely supported by the conservative majority that represents Finney County and Kansas (see Exhibit 6). Garden City’s greatest media source, The Garden City Telegram, published a newspaper article in 2007 entitled “Another virtual school to come online in state.” In the article, Emily Behlmann contends, “Yet another online program for Kansas high school students is springing up with Kaplan Academy of Kansas, a virtual high school operated by the national organization Kaplan Virtual Education” (2007, para 1). Additionally, Behlmann contends:

Rick Atha, superintendent for USD 457 Garden City, said that although the district has lost a few students to virtual schools, including 16 to 21st
Century Learning Academy at Mullinville USD 424, he is reluctant to start a Garden City program or partner with Southwind Virtual School in Sublette until he sees how oversight and funding work at the others. (2009, para. 19)

Since 2007, many more online schools have sprung up across the state. According to the Kansas Department of Education, 47 virtual schools are active and have students enrolled for the 2010-2011 school year. Since charter schools do not have to follow the same guidelines for publication, it is difficult to ascertain a specific number of students in Garden City attending virtual charter schools. According to one source, nineteen students attend virtual school. According to another interviewed source, as many as 300 students, K-12, attend virtual schools in Finney County. The two most popular online schools for Garden City students include Hugoton Learning Academy and 21st Century Learning Academy. For example, in Table 6, a blogger responded to a City-Data.com post entitled: “Garden City - Virtual Online Schooling for High School students”.

Home schooling is one of the fastest growing alternatives to traditional public education. Again, it is difficult to ascertain a specific number of students in Garden City who are being home schooled. According to one interviewed source, an education constituent in the community, as many as 200 families in Finney County are being home schooled. According to Kurt J. Bauman (2002) of the US Census Bureau, home schoolers are more likely to be non-Hispanic White, typically from households with moderate to high education and income, and located in the rural or suburban West.

It is quite frustrating for researchers that for-profit schooling, such as the charter and virtual schools, and even the tax-based homeschooling that enroll Garden City’s children, do not publish their enrollment figures. Chomsky (1999), world-renowned political activist and foremost scholar on mass media contends, “Large corporations have resources to influence media and overwhelm the political process, and do so accordingly” (p. 10). Instead of telling the untold story of how Tyson, the multinational slaughterhouse corporation in Garden City, has completely transformed the demographics of a small rural town in the Heartland, the media extol the community efforts to embrace diversity and multiculturalism.

It is important to view Tyson for what it is: a private, profit-seeking, huge corporation whose efforts often have dire consequences for the cultural and economic life of the communities in which it locates its plants. The town may be
prospering and financially sound during a time of economic uncertainty in America, but it has come at a huge price, socially, ecologically, and educationally.

**White Flight and Online Forums**

As mentioned previously, blogs and online forums provide credible qualitative data. Online forums often reveal a kind of blunt truth that research participants are sometimes not willing to share. To address the general public about White flight in Garden City in hopes of getting a general consensus and to elicit responses, the following initial post was published by me in a City-Data.com Online Forum (see Table 7). According to Table 7, several of the posts have one response in common: White kids who leave for either college or for an out-of-town job do not end up moving back to reside in Garden City…the ultimate flight from rural America, but not on the face of it a flight from ethnic and racial diversity. The posts speak specifically to the lack of jobs in rural communities. However, the posts also complain about the education in Garden City. For example, one post suggests that schools in Cimarron and Ingalls are popular choices for both Garden City and Dodge City so students can get a “decent education.” Often people dissemble by saying they want better academic settings for their children instead of revealing their true motives. Politicians and many media outlets are notorious for dissembling.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 7 Are White People Fleeing Garden City, KS? City-Data.com</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALWAYSLEARNINGABOUTLIFE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03-11-2011, 03:16 PM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Junior Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Join Date: Mar 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 posts, read 163 times</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reputation: 10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>pioneer88</th>
<th>03-12-2011, 07:52 AM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senior Member</td>
<td>I would say it is many of the kids leave for college and stay in Wichita, KC or Denver. The city is still experiencing growth because of the jobs, but many of these jobs are being filled by new immigrants. I don't necessarily look at it as fleeing the city, but instead just that around the country smaller towns are experiencing a brain drain of their young</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Join Date: Jan 2009</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Location: KC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>215 posts, read 172,341 times</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reputation: 94</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Username</td>
<td>Message</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modron</td>
<td>Kansans have been leaving the state for a long time. My family left western Kansas in the 1960s, long after their Volga German immigrant parents moved there, but long before the new immigrant wave. Kansans are moving away. The current group of immigrants are just moving in and filling the void.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GraniteStater</td>
<td>That is correct. I am another one who grew up in Kansas and has long since moved away- will likely not be returning. Most counties in the state have seen huge amounts of out-migration, and spot labor shortages have been a result (just one reason why unemployment rates are quite low in many of the rural and frontier counties of KS). Therefore, most population growth in KS is generally attributal to immigration, both legal as well as illegal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empires228</td>
<td>Add to the above statements that most of the White Families in town are older families (I don't know what the half white and half Hispanic kids get counted as) whose children are no longer part of the school system. The kids who do come back after college are usually the ones who have lots of family they can't or don't want to leave behind. Looking at the pie charts of race as provided on USD 457's Website Garden City Schools have less kids in poverty and a slightly lower amount of Hispanic enrolment then both Dodge City and Liberal. I don't</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
think white people are fleeing Dodge City or Liberal. Also more parents in the Garden City and Dodge City districts have been choosing to send kids to other schools so they can actually get a decent education. All the schools out here have high teacher turnover rates because of the rural location. Cimarron and Ingalls are popular choices for both Garden and Dodge. Central Elementary in Dodge City for example has something like 99% Hispanic enrollment and 98% of them are economically disadvantaged but that doesn’t mean white people are fleeing. It just depends on the age of the races and the neighborhood makeup.

AnywhereElse
Senior Member
Status: "Faithful" (set 19 days ago)

03-14-2011, 05:03 AM

About 10 years ago we looked at both Dodge City and Garden City and we were looking at schools where our child would be a minority, our child is white. Also, because of the high cost of educating children who do not speak English, they would have nothing left for the special education budget. We saw the same thing in the rural area around Tucson, AZ. Also, if you look at the other threads concerning gangs, how many new residents other than illegals would they be attracting? Seriously, the crime there is bad. KS is trying to push something through Congress right now to give something along the lines of tax credits to young people who come back or don't leave the state which I think is a bad idea with the economic crunch since the schools here have taken 2 or 3 hits on their budget already this year and so many people look at the quality of schools these days. Plus, I am guessing most jobs in Garden City and Dodge City require some Spanish? It has all gone overboard with KS being a safe
haven for illegals. The in-state college tuition for illegals (hopefully taken away as it passed the House and is headed to the Senate) and Pittsburg tried to pass something to let illegals have driver's licenses because they thought it would make their streets safer. This is not about race, it is about illegal and having a border that is open and let's anyone from any nation with any agenda come into the US while people in their 80's are having to be searched and having to remove their shoes to board an airplane.

jiacosta30
Junior Member

Join Date: Apr 2011
1 posts, read 14 times
Reputation: 13

01-01-2011, 08:05 AM

All u people just make me sick, by hearing all of your prejudice remarks. When it should not matter what color or race you are we come to America for Reson land of opportunites and for us to work take care of our families and work and send are kids to school. Another thing get your statements clear were not (Aliens).. And the latinos are not the one who started 09/11 or were not at war.... ANOTHER thing this land belong to the Mexico and Indians so you white people how do u come along and act like this country or even town belongs to you guys. And yes us latinos are hard workers we will do wat ever it takes just to bring in money for our family...Because you whites are picky and choosey.. All u whites also complain about us but you sure like our food... Then come up with Taco Bell jajajajaj...Der is a god and he teaching was not to be like this, Martin Luther King Jr, Abraham Lincoln

The same question about White Flight in Garden City was addressed by the author to a Topix.com Online Forum. Similar xenophobic responses were found (see Table 8).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 8</th>
<th>Are White People Fleeing Garden City, KS? Topix.com</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mike Chandler, AZ</td>
<td>Sunday Mar 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are White People Fleeing Garden City, KS?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The facts are clear: Whites have become a minority in Garden City, KS. A CNN article published in 2009 is clear about this demographic fact. As the article suggests, the meatpacking industry has drawn workers from Mexico, Southeast Asia, and Somalia. However, what is most interesting, from a demographic perspective, is that white folks seem to be fleeing Garden City, or at least the white students enrolled in the Garden City – USD 457 Public School District. White student enrollment has decreased from 4,096 white students in 1992-1993 to 1,883 white students in 2010-2011. This 54% decrease in the white student population is a significant statistic that no one can overlook. My question is simple: Where are the white students going and why are they leaving? I am open to all ideas and suggestions.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GC Ks Garden City, KS</td>
<td>Tuesday Mar 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not only fleeing Garden City, but Kansas. Beaners are everywhere - won't drive the speed limit on Sundays. Government is getting even more involved in personal lives. Can't wait to get out of here.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bradley Wichita Wichita, KS</td>
<td>Tuesday Mar 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I’m sure there are many reason for leaving. As the letter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
above reflects, some do not care for Mexican people; others may have left for better employment, education or other opportunities. I have a hunch Wichita was a popular place to relocate but again that is just a guess.


“Beaners” is possibly the most derogatory term you could attribute to the Hispanic population. According to UrbanDictionary.com, a “Beaner” is defined as, “Lazy, irreverent, uneducated people of Latin American culture that infest our public schools so that their Anchor Babies can learn the English language to translate for their ignorant parents that are too lazy to learn it themselves.”

**White Flight and Garden City Interviews**

It was difficult to get an insider perspective about White flight in Garden City from any of the community constituents interviewed. As soon as
interviewees were told they were going to be recorded, it was as if the filter came on to mask the vitriol and xenophobia that was so easily exposed in the online forums. A certain degree of this was expected.

Upon the initial influx of minority populations in the community, several Anglo community constituents found it difficult to understand a population other than their own. For example, one interviewee stated, “So it was quite a challenge for the good old boys that had been plowing the fields for years around here to take on a lot of those different populations” (See Appendix, Interview #2).

Additionally, “My understanding of the history of the community was that there were some lines of demarcation within the community that divided different factions of even that group that, much like you might see in San Francisco, where certain ethnic groups - Thou shalt not cross the street. We had a little bit of that, evidently, going on in Garden City” (See Appendix, Interview #2).

When questioned about whether the interviewee was able to personally see a decrease in the numbers of White enrollment in school, he suggested:

Well, yes - depending on which school. For instance, we have 10 elementaries here at [present]. And we traditionally - when I first came here - we had kind of the south side schools that were traditionally more Hispanic. We had the schools on the north east part of town that were pretty much upper-middle class White kids. And through the years that whole ethnic base and the minority populations amongst all of our schools has changed tremendously. (See Appendix, Interview #2)

The education constituent also stated that “white students, upon graduation, leave the community and do not come back to resettle” (See Appendix, Interview #2)…the ultimate flight from rural life. Additionally, the
The interviewee said it could be because of “where the jobs are and who’s doing the jobs…a preponderance of those folks are Hispanic” (See Appendix, Interview #2). This response supports a socio-economic class difference based on the opportunities of White community members to minority community members.

When pressed to explain if White flight existed in the community, the interviewee stated:

Now there are some realities, Michael, that may or may not be something that people would like out of the closet. But I think there are some realities that... while on surface, Garden City I think has done a tremendous job of assimilating the new cultures, bringing them in, making them part of the community, making them part of the school district. And out on the open I think really doing a good job of melding everything together. I think there are still some folks of... and I have to be careful if I say this because I don't want to sound racial at all, but there are some folks that, you know, of World War II age maybe, maybe a little younger, that still have some feelings of: we are being overrun. (See Appendix, Interview #2)

This answer elicits a xenophobic response, an intolerance of minority populations by white community members. One can clearly see the participant was very careful how he responded so he did not sound “racist.” No matter how one measures it, some degree of xenophobia exists in Garden City more than thirty years after the first meatpacking plant opened.
Chapter 5
Conclusion

The facts of this case study are clear: White student enrollment in the Garden City School District has decreased from 4,096 in 1992-1993 to 1,883 in 2010-2011, a 54% decline in the face of overall enrollment growth mostly attributed to a 204% Hispanic student population growth. White flight in Garden City is real—to what extent and to what degree depend largely on the motives and stakes actors have to gain or lose in the face of adversity and confrontation. Responses speak volumes to actors’ motives. To deny motives is to deny reliable, credible research. When a recorder was thrust in front of a participant, responses were rehearsed and superficial. When responses were anonymous, motives behind opinions and actions became clearer.

Within the human, economic, and socio-cultural limitations of Garden City, the rural community has attempted to cope sincerely to revise, improve, and adapt its culture in the face of a rapid demographic change. Garden City and its residents are still adapting. Unfortunately, there exists in Garden City an entity that could do much to facilitate this process; however, this corporation appears unwilling to

Exhibit 7: Tyson Finney County Kansas Plant. Photo taken March 2010 outside Plant in Holcomb, KS
press the issue or give it attention. It would go against the very grain of its economic model: to exploit cheap labor, make as much money as possible, and keep the majority ignorant (see Exhibit 7).

Stull and Broadway (2004) argue that “the past 30 years have witnessed a return to the jungle…unions were broken; wages were slashed; benefits were eliminated; and armies of recent immigrants were recruited by the meatpacking industry in order to gain cheap, docile labor” (p. xiii). Perhaps state and federal governments should readdress social and economic inequalities and look to the condition of the least advantaged members of society, those populations that now constitute the majority in Garden City’s schools. The entire social, political, and economic life of Garden City, Kansas, have been turned upside-down since the arrival of two meatpacking plants a little more than thirty years ago. This has resulted in significant consequences for equity and equality, not only in every facet of the community, but also in the Garden City School District. Now, when people think of Garden City, many only think of it as “the meatpacking town,” or the “trophy buckle on the beef belt” (see Exhibit 8).

According to Frank (2005), “On the High Plains the packers are about the only game in town…and they use their power accordingly” (pp. 52-53).
According to Chomsky (1999), “neoliberalism is the defining political economic paradigm of our time—it refers to the policies and processes whereby a relative handful of private interests are permitted to control as much as possible of social life in order to maximize their personal profit” (p. 1). Chomsky argues that neoliberalism, a pro-corporate system of economic and political policies, is waging a form of class war worldwide. Chomsky contends that the ruling class use markets and regulations selectively to distort and secure profits for the privileged. Although Tyson and other huge corporations know this, the vast majority of laypersons are unaware. This is primarily due to the influence these corporations have on the media for their corporate agenda.

Corporations use their money and power to affect state policies. The state provides large subsidies to major corporations. Subsidies, tax breaks, and industrial policies generally benefit the rich. This creates a greater disparity between the wealthy and poor communities across the nation. In Garden City, it appears that demographics prevail, and sociopolitical environments continue to determine the actual game in town. The last headline the media wants to publish in Garden City is that the town is replete with xenophobes or that its schools are becoming segregated…there are too may special interests that would suffer under those claims.

Lies and Hushed Innuendoes
Many lies exist in Garden City. Immigrants lie to themselves by saying they should expect less simply because they were not born as a natural citizen in the United States. Corporations lie to immigrants by saying they provide a working environment with excellent pay and benefits (see Exhibit 9), when in reality they do not provide insurance for months, the wage is barely enough for families to survive, and turnover rate would make most corporations want to file for bankruptcy.

Corporations, as an untold rule, generally like to remain quiet. However, when forced to make a public announcement, corporations weave masterful lies of increased economy for the city, excellent working conditions, and nobility of factory workers to process thousands of pounds of meat that provide for all the country’s dinner tables. Corporations say nothing about the meatpacking industry being statistically the most dangerous job in the industrialized nation or that they go out of their way to exploit an immigrant labor force in order to easily pay them less in order to make bigger profits.

Exhibit 9: Tyson “Help Wanted” Sign. Photo taken March 2010 outside Plant in Holcomb, KS
Another lie resonates throughout Garden City and it is very difficult to notice without a keen eye for detail and anonymous responses from community constituents with absolutely no positive or negative motivation behind their responses. This includes lies parents tell their children about the “other kids.” Perhaps parents do this unknowingly because they are simply ignorant, or they do this insidiously because they do not want to be “that parent.” Either way, it breeds intolerance from one generation to the next.

A lie profoundly bigger in numbers resonates throughout the United States: The American Dream. The term “American Dream” was first coined during the Great Depression in an atmosphere of even greater despair than today. The term suggested that through hard work and perseverance, anyone could pull him or herself out of poverty and achieve greatness. This is really the heart of the idea of laissez faire policy that eventually transformed itself into capitalism and then went on to include neoliberal economic policies—the perfect breeding ground for corporate fascism. Thus, the American Dream is accessible to all, or so the corporate driven media contend. The dark side to the American Dream, however, assumes that if anyone can achieve prosperity with hard work, then those who fail to achieve it must not be working hard enough. This delusion contributes to the continued exploitation of minority and working class citizens in America. Frank (2005) asserts:

One thing you do see these days are the trailer-park cities, dilapidated and unpaved and rubbish-strewn, that house a large part of Garden City’s workforce. Confronted with some of the most advanced union-avoidance strategies ever conceived by the mind of business man, these people
receive mediocre wages for doing what is statistically the most dangerous work in the industrial America. (p. 53)

The idea of the American Dream assumed that there would never exist an aristocracy of wealth because the instruments of financial success were available to every person. This does not appear to be the case today. Now, more than ever, the disparity between the wealthy and the poor appears to have widened, while civic responsibility has withered. While the middle class grows deeper in debt and the federal budget continues to dwindle, all non-profit public entities are left standing idle and stagnant. Perhaps Adam Smith is correct: Americans no longer have the money nor the sense of civic responsibility to care about anything other than their own self-interest.

The Demise of America

In the 1960-70s, more than 1,000 meatpacking companies offered one of the highest-paid unionized industrial jobs in the United States with one of the lowest turnover rates. It provided a decent, middle class life. Since then, meatpacking companies consolidated into only about three “powerhouse” meatpacking corporations: Tyson, ConAgra, and Cargill. These three corporations are responsible for pretty much all the poultry and beef production in the United States.

To put multinational farming and slaughterhouse corporations into the perspective of the larger context of the United States and the world, it is relevant
to understand the advent of agriculture. The agricultural revolution began 10,000 years ago when people in different parts of the world began to domesticate plants and animals. Very few hunter gathers survive in the world today. From all accounts, the invention of agriculture and farming seems to be a progressive step for society and mankind. However, according to UCLA anthropologist Jared Diamond (1987), “recent discoveries suggest that the adoption of agriculture, supposedly our most decisive step toward a better life, was in many ways a catastrophe from which we have never recovered” (p. 64). In fact, Diamond suggests that the adoption of agriculture may be the worst mistake in the history of the human race. This statement seems dramatic, incredible, and even a little contentious. However, archeological evidence from the bones and feces of hunter gathers suggest that hunter-gatherers were not only healthier, but enjoyed the most successful and longest lasting lifestyle in human history. Diamond argues, “with agriculture came the gross social and sexual inequality, the disease and despotism, that curse our existence” (p. 64). 10,000 years ago, hunter gathers were faced with perhaps mankind’s most difficult decision: forced to choose between limiting population or trying to increase food production, they chose the latter and according to Diamond, “ended up with starvation, warfare, and tyranny” (p 66). In the last 10,000 years, society “progressed” from nomadic hunter-gatherers, to small sect agricultural communities, to family farms, to multinational corporate farming and slaughterhouse enterprises. Perhaps population increase was inevitable, but what was the price of this progress?
Andrew Ross Sorkin (2009) just completed, *Too Big to Fail: The Inside Story of How Wall Street and Washington Fought to Save the Financial System—and Themselves*. Why is this book relevant for agriculture? Perhaps the “too big to fail” conundrum will someday apply to the agriculture sector. What would happen if one of these powerhouse corporations threatened bankruptcy and liquidation? Not only would there be a huge shortage of meat offered to consumers to feed their families, but every corporate hog and cattle farmer who contracts with these meatpacking houses would scream for a bailout or federal aid since they have nobody to sell their hogs and cattle to.

**The Future of Public Education in Garden City and the Nation**

The neoliberal approaches to education such as the No Child Left Behind Act, Race to the Top, and other education reforms promoting high-stakes testing, accountability, and competitive markets, has replaced the previously dominant social democratic approaches. Perhaps government and education policy makers should reevaluate Rawls’s (1971) justice-as-fairness doctrine. Governments should redress social and economic inequalities and look to the benefit for the least advantaged members of society, those populations that now hold the majority in Garden City’s public schools. As Berliner (2006) proposed, this research could provide an example to policymakers and districts to focus less attention on classrooms and schools, as suggested by all the high-stakes
accountability measures, and more on neighborhoods and what happens to children outside of school.

Since the rich and prosperous communities, “the social and political elite,” can afford better quality and greater quantities in education, disparities between students and regions will remain, and even widen. The gap will continue to grow between the wealthy and the poor. The wealthy elite of a demographic area will continue to segregate themselves from the poorer parts of the area, producing the common phenomenon of White flight in education. Since community financing is a form of regressive taxation, it will fall most heavily on the poorest who are least able to afford it.

Is it the responsibility of all community constituents to demand quality education, an environment where segregation does not exist, and an atmosphere where all students can learn and become successful members of society? According to Cobb and Glass (2009), “policymakers should resist adopting fiscally attractive, unregulated choice programs that further the segregation of students and that lack evidence of academic success with poor students of color” (p. 273), (see Exhibit 10). The appropriate social and political context must be considered in order for this to take place. Educational policy and reform should be a way to reduce troubling economic disparity between the wealthy and poor and encourage social justice and democratic values. It appears neoliberal economic policies continue to reproduce educational inequalities and social and
economical hierarchies that benefit only the rich and powerful, and fall most heavily on students of color.

Perhaps Americans will continue their blind approval and cynical disillusionment about the inequities that plague America. This self-righteous, Eurocentric right-of-passage is as American as apple pie. Instead of buttressing xenophobia and ethnophobia, promoting material self-interest, often at the expense of those less fortunate, and continuing to divide America between the haves and have-nots, America needs to transcend and create a new humanism that encourages equality, justice, and democracy, even at a time when the lack of financial comfort and security make it seem nearly impossible.

REFERENCES


APPENDIX A

INTERVIEW #2
Interviewer: Alright, so, are you familiar with exactly what I'm studying?

Education Constituent #1: Not exactly. I read your consent form a little bit and so I have some idea and I'm comfortable with whatever. I'm pretty open with putting our community in the glass container, if you will.

Interviewer: Alright. Well, I've been doing research and I've been studying a lot of enrollment statistics and for the last 10, 15 years, actually probably more like 18 years I have noticed a lot of... and I know that the Hispanic population and Somali and Burmese and all of that population has been increasing over the years. That's obvious because of the meat packing plants in the community. However, I've also noticed that the enrollment statistics for white students, that has been declining over the years, actually, pretty drastically. I guess I was just wondering if you've seen, if you've personally seen that trend in the community since you've kind of.... how long have you lived in the community?

Education Constituent #1: I moved here in January of 1975.

Interviewer: OK, so you've been around when the first meat packing plant came to town.

Education Constituent #1: Right, right. I was here a few years before IBP came in and they came in in about 1980. When I first came to Garden City, the community was maybe 16, 000 16, 500, something like that and then in 1980 when Iowa Beef Packers opened, that's when we started the tremendous growth and the influx of so many minority populations other than Hispanic - the traditional ones that we've had in the community since the turn of the century.

Interviewer: Sure. But you have also seen a rise in the Hispanic population, correct? Because I know that you guys originally had some Hispanic population there at the turn of the century because they were working at, what was it, beets or something?

Education Constituent #1: Yes. We had a beet factory here. Great Western Sugar Company had purchased a lot of land in this area and they ran it under the Garden City Company name. They had a lot of sugar beets. So at that point, they brought in a lot of Mexican Indians from Arizona, New Mexico and the southwest. So there was a tremendous number of Mexican people at that point. They obviously weren't called Hispanics until much later in the whole history of ethnic groups. I guess Hispanics, that wasn't even something we knew about at that point. But those folks came in and worked the sugar beet factories and worked in the fields. So we had somewhat indigenous, at least at that point, groups of Mexican people that were here. My understanding of the history of the community was that there were some lines of demarcation within the community that divided different factions of even that group that, much like you might see in San Francisco, where certain ethnic groups - Thou shalt not
cross the street. We had a little bit of that, evidently, going on in Garden City.

So we had that tradition, but it wasn't until probably 1980 that all of a sudden we had tremendous influxes of different kinds of minority populations. We had a large influx of Vietnamese, Mong, Laotian, Cambodian, more the Southeast Asian cultures was really the situation there.

During those early years, in the early 80's we had as many as 30 plus modeling languages being spoken in a school district at that time that was say 4500 kids K-12.

**Interviewer:** Sure.

**Education Constituent #1:** So it was quite a challenge for the good old boys that had been plowing the fields for years around here to take on a lot of those different populations and especially populations that it wasn't just a matter of increasing the Hispanics that they were so much familiar with. There were some populations that they had no idea really how to deal with at some points.

**Interviewer:** Sure, sure.

**Education Constituent #1:** Their cultures were so much different.

**Interviewer:** Sure. Did these new minorities to the community, let's say the big influx during, I'm assuming 80's, and then throughout, did they all move in a certain area? Did they create their own little demographic area within the community?

**Education Constituent #1:** Well, to some extent. Initially, especially I think, simply because a lot of them came with very little and then IBP did some work, I think, to help relocate them. They came with sponsorships from local churches and different entities but they tended to assimilate themselves into small communities. They developed their own business community, if you will. We have a strip of one street here in Garden City that maintains, even to this day, a significant number of eating establishments, a significant number of grocery store kinds of places, that kind of thing. There's a little bit of a referral to that as a little Saigon kind of place where there's a strip of Fulton Street that is a few blocks long that a lot of those folks pretty much put their businesses.

**Interviewer:** Sure.

**Education Constituent #1:** But...

**Interviewer:** Do they have a specific name for it?

**Education Constituent #1:** No, no, other than just the community is kind of referred to it like you would refer to the strip where all the fast foods might be
with say 'fast food alley'. So this has been referred to as 'Little Saigon' or there perhaps some other things that have various degrees of political correctness. But they did kind of establish themselves a business area. One of the things that happened [inaudible] through the years was that as these people came in, some of them came in and collected a monetary wealth, if you will, because they were very frugal people - especially the Vietnamese that come in early.

Interviewer: Sure.

Education Constituent #1: They collected a financial base and then they moved back to the coast and so on. And so our percentages of the South East Asian reached somewhat of a peak, and now they are back to a much smaller number. But a lot of the folks that have stayed - and Hispanics as well as other ethnic groups - those that have stayed have been very successful. Now you find them migrating into housing development that traditionally were more Anglo. They are assimilating themselves more into the community in that way as far as coming into the housing areas, establishing their businesses more city wide. So they have very much been able to assimilate themselves into the community in virtually every facet - from churches to housing developments to the medical community now have a significant number of folks of various ethnic backgrounds and so on.

Interviewer: All right. Were you able to personally see a decrease in the numbers of White enrollment in school?

Education Constituent #1: Well, yes - depending on which school. For instance, we have 10 elementaries here at [present]. And we traditionally - when I first came here - we had kind of the south side schools that were traditionally more Hispanic. We had the schools on the north east part of town that were pretty much upper-middle class White kids. And through the years that whole ethnic base and the minority populations amongst all of our schools has changed tremendously. My wife, for instance, is principal in another building that for years and years their minority population would be less than 10%. Now they are 50 plus percent. My particular building is kind of in the middle of the whole mix. Closer to the south side traditionally would have been a south sided community type of school. My traditionally minority population, mostly which is Hispanic, would run between 75-80%, I suppose. You move a little further south then you are talking 98-99%. So those were pretty saturated and have been for years and years and years.

But if you took the community as a whole, yes, almost all of the schools now are much more saturated with traditional minorities. And our community, I think, just recently, has become one of not too many communities around that the traditional minority population now has surpassed the Anglo population and is passed the 50%. So, the Anglos, we have now become the population
minority.

**Interviewer:** Sure. So as I look at the statistics, I know that obviously these new minority populations have moved into the area but also, the Anglo or White population, the enrollment figures have gone down and gone down drastically. So, where are these kids going to school if they are not going to, let say, your school or your wife's school? I know that everything's a little bit more saturated but where are these kids going? I have no idea, and I am just wondering. Do we have private, charter or homeschooling? Do they move?

**Education Constituent #1:** You know, Michael, I don't know that if I can give you an exact answer to that. I do know that through the course of the last 30 years and, probably, even the course of the last 15 to 20 years, homeschooling - we have significant number of homeschoolers, which through the years since, probably, 1985 to 90, somewhere in that neighborhood, have become much more organized and much more viable, I guess, as educational alternatives. In this community we have two parochial schools that have been around for years, catholic based. We have a couple of church based schools that handle just in their church facilities pretty much some of the lower grades. So I don't know what the actual bleed off would be there from the total population if you took all of those and put it together. I don't know that number.

But it is a bit of a puzzle. I am not sure whether the total numbers of Anglos have actually decreased that has caused the percentage to go up, or whether it is the tremendous influx of Hispanics that have caused that balance to be skewed to where the percentage goes up. I don't know that it is if we have lost so many Anglos. It's just that the Hispanics have increased so much that, that percentage becomes swayed that way.

And all of that is just opinion. That's not a question that I have really thought about before. I don't know that "all the White kids got on the bus and left." I don't think that. I don't necessarily see that. And again, I am living in a world here of my building where we always have been pretty high Hispanic. And so, I don't have a real concise answer for you there, Michael. I apologize. That's just a perception, I guess.

**Interviewer:** All right. Well, just to let you know the statistics that I have - you know, you can find them online. Like in 1992 and 1993, the enrollment of White students...the total enrollment throughout the district - and that's meaning K through 12 - you had 2, 082 male White students and 2, 014 female White students. And then just this last year, 2009-2010, you have 987 White male students and 904 White female students. So it's gone down drastically, and I guess I was just wondering...So, I mean, it's not a percentage thing that I guess...
Education Constituent #1: Sure, it's a actual number thing that you are showing.

Interviewer: Yeah. And so, I guess I am just wondering. You know the community members. Obviously, you are putting on that [Bluegrass] festival, and you know people in town. Do you have friends or family or white community constituents that have just said: "I am just going to get up and move to a different town, or do I go somewhere else, or do I move from..."

Education Constituent #1: I don't think so. I ha have not heard that attitude that it would be overrun and goodbye.

Interviewer: Sure.

Education Constituent #1: If that is the kind of question, I have never heard that. Now there are some realities, Michael, l that may or may not be something that people would like out of the closet. But I think there are some realities that... while on surface, Garden City I think has done a tremendous job of assimilating the new cultures, bringing them in, making them part of the community, making them part of the school district. And out on the open I think really doing a good job of melding everything together. I think there are still some folks of... and I have to be careful if I say this because I don't want to sound racial at all, but there are some folks that, you know, of World War II age maybe, maybe a little younger, that still has some feelings of: we are being overrun. And I don't that is anything indigenous in our community, I think it's a feeling of Kansas, of [inaudible], of...

Interviewer: Sure.

Education Constituent #1: ... of generation, that kind of thing. So I have been very proud of this community in the way that they have taken on the influx of these populations. We raised our own children here and they got out of here being relatively color blind. In fact, our son when he first went out to check the one of the colleges that he was looking at, his first comment was they are all white people here. And I guess, I never even thought about that. But it was so engrained in him that we are a society of multi-culturism and multi-ethnic backgrounds. And for him to go to that place where it did not exist, that was eerie to him. So I think that it's been a great place to be, but to say that everybody in the community is in love with the way things are probably is a false statement. But openly and out in the public, I think we have celebrated the different cultures and welcome them and we have tried to provide. I would guess that we have as many if not more kinds of community organizations or whatever from those who would help people coming in as newcomers to those who would help people of poverty.

We have a tremendous [inaudible], I think, of socio economic background of
our community and some of that I may have be seeing that as through rose colored glass simply because of the population that I have here in my building. But we have about 85% of my kids are on free and reduced lunches. I have in the 25 to 30 percent of my parents is all [inaudible] have high school education. And so the literacy rates, the population that we are dealing with are a lot of unskilled labor kind of folks. Great people! Don't ever misinterpret that.

Interviewer: Sure.

Education Constituent #1: They are great people. But life has been different for them than it was for some of us who have had the opportunity to be successful. So that is just a reality that we deal with.

Interviewer: Sure. So, do you know if a lot of the parents of your students in your school? Do a lot of them work at Tyson's?

Education Constituent #1: Yes and I don't know again the percentages. But a lot of the parents work at the packing plant or in similar businesses like maybe the box factory or maybe refrigeration places, job or kinds of places that might do mechanical work or might do bearing work or might do support kinds of services that still are centered around the packing industry. We also through the course of the last ...oh...eight, ten years maybe give or take a little bit, have had several good size day operations: commercial dairy operations, open in the area that lot of our parents work at. I really don't have any hard figures as to who works where, but just off the top of my head, we have a lot of people that if I go to call a parent, they would be working in nursing homes, they would be working in service kind of jobs like that or McDonalds or restaurant [inaudible] help. Pretty much, I would say that there is an extremely high percentage that work in unskilled labor positions.

And again, nothing wrong with that. We got to have all those people do their jobs and they are hardworking and they are good people and they love their kids. And they are just doing the best they can. But, there is a high percentage our professional numbers of people in my particular building that would work in professional kinds of jobs and be people with degrees, that is a fairly small percentage.

Interviewer: Sure. I guess the only theory that I'm kind of thinking about here is that perhaps like your students, or like your kids your own kids, perhaps they...and this could happen to a lot of the other communities members, you stayed in town, all the parents kind of stayed in town and they were the parents in the last twenty years have become older. Their kids have gone and kind of grown up and left the school. As a result, you don't have the continuing population perhaps... basically all your kids and all the kids that you taught fifteen or twenty years ago, they are not continuing to settle in the community.
perhaps and as a result then you see a decrease in the enrollment. Does that make sense?

**Education Constituent #1:** I think you may be close there, Michael, because... I mean, I'll use my own kids again as an example. My son now works at the University of Kansas and our daughter is a senior there in civil engineering, graduated out of here number one in her class, went on as a national merit scholar and so on and probably has no desire, no inclination to ever come back maybe even to Kansas let alone Garden City to live. And I think that there's probably some truth to that as I think about my kids and their friends and the people they associated with that have graduated and moved on - very few of those kids live here.

**Interviewer:** Sure.

**Education Constituent #1:** They have moved out. Much like someone of us did - you included - out of your hometown. We've left there. And I guess maybe the relationship that I would see there - I, like you, grew up in a small town of maybe 3,000 on a good day, no minorities [hardly] - Bohemians, Czechs, Germans, whatever. And while we got a good base there, most of the population...Now, I don't the average age. It's probably 55 to 60, maybe 60 to 65, in that whole community and it is dying away. So that population has died away and because of no industry there has been replaced. Here that older population, that White population, may have migrated out. But the difference was that we had the opportunity for unskilled labor here, plus we are on a somewhat of a direct corridor out of Mexico, out of Texas. We are kind of in the southwest part of the world here geographically. So everything kind of came together as a possibility for unskilled labor, minority populations to come in here and settle. It became kind of [mentor] for that. So I think you are probably closer then not on your thinking there.

**Interviewer:** All right. I guess we can probably wrap it up here. The only thing that I am thinking is: what is your last opinion? Do you think that Tyson...From your understanding with perhaps talking to parents or whatever else, do you think Tyson is treating its employees pretty decent, or do you think that they don't pay them enough or that they do pay them enough? I mean, do you think that perhaps, you know...I have done a lot of research on the meat packing industry, and I just know that at one point in our lives you growing up, you know, in the 1960's or 50's when meat packing plants were very unionized, there was an opportunity where you could really make a good wage off of being a meat packing worker.

And now, it's like, you know, they want to be efficient with everything. They only recruit a certain ethnicity and a certain population. And they go out of their way to go to Mexico to recruit these people; bring them up on buses; do
whatever they can do, you know, word of mouth of course spreads too. But do you think that perhaps they could...What's your opinion on the way they treat them?

**Education Constituent #1**: Well, my thinking on that, I guess, would center around turnover figures that we have seen through the years. At some points pretty significant turnover in the population of workers there. I would hesitate as someone from the outside looking in to say, "Well, its always because of this or this or this." I think there's one reality that has been consistent through the time is that working in the beef packing industry is extremely, extremely physically demanding. And while from the outside looking in as an unskilled employee, I might see what I have always felt were pretty decent wages. I would see those as looking pretty good. And I would jump in as a young person thinking, "Shoot, I can go out there and make what my teacher that's telling me to stay in school is making." But then reality sets in that this is boring work. It's repetitive work. It's extremely difficult work. It is production work of, either, you put up or you go away kind of work.

And so I think that a lot of turnover that I see...And then I hear my parents come in and say, you know - when I say, "Well, where are you working, you still working at Tyson?" "No, man, I had to quit that because I just couldn't take it. I found a job where I could, one, be home with my kids maybe more, but I just couldn't take the physical part of it."

So the only thing that I can validly back up with anything that I think substantiate personally would be that versus, you know...I don't what they wage is and how it compares to what they can get at other places. I am guessing it is a significant more than they would get at Wal-Mart, or McDonalds, or those kinds of places. But is it commiserate with other places in the packing industry? Is it a situation where if they were unionized that it would be better for them? I don't know.

I mean, I have seen union situations that sometimes with all good intentions sometimes don't turn out like the worker thought they would, either. So I don't have that information really that I would feel comfortable saying, "Oh, yeah, it's always because of this." But I do know that the work itself is extremely demanding or extremely repetitive, which I think works not only the physical part of its employees but also the mental part of the employees. And I think if anything extraneous to all the other things that we talked about like wages and whatever, working conditions, I think that probably has as much affect on the turnover and the movement in and out.

They got to have people that can work together. I know they have experimented with different populations. The most recent are the Somalians and the Burmese. And the word on the street really is that...and without identifying a specific one,
I will just say they are finding that someone populations are much easier to manage and work with than others. So they are kind of still experimenting with, you know, "If we are going to bring someone in other than the traditional Hispanic, Vietnamese, Cambodian, Laotian that we have been working with, what kinds of populations can we bring in that we can actually get along with and that can get along with our other employees and really be productive workers?"

So we find some of that. And, of course, as those experimentations take place in the workforce, obviously that filtrates down to us in the school district and we are back up to 18, I think, different monolingual languages being spoken currently, with several of those being dialectic differences in the Somalian and Burmese cultures.

**Interviewer**: Mm-hmm.

**Education Constituent #1**: So, I don't know. I feel like I am kind of rambling around our question there, Michael. But a lot of it is just a feeling that I have as opposed to anything I have on a piece of paper that's exact.

**Interviewer**: Honestly, that's what I am looking and that's completely fine. I am going to ahead and stop the tape recorder if that's all right.

**Education Constituent #1**: OK. [audio ends]

Transcription by CastingWords
# SOCIAL BEHAVIORAL APPLICATION HUMAN SUBJECTS

## PROTOCOL INFORMATION

**Protocol Title:** DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGE AND WHITE FLIGHT IN RURAL AMERICA: THE CASE OF GARDEN CITY, KANSAS

**Date:** 2/1/2011

## PRINCIPAL INVESTIGATOR (PI)

**Name and Degree(s):** Gene V Glass

**Department/Center:** Emeritus Professor of the Mary Lou Fulton College of Education

## Mailing Address:

**Email:** Gene Glass <glass@asu.edu>  
**Phone:**  
**Fax:**

**University Affiliation:**
- [ ] Professor (Emeritus Professor)
- [ ] Associate Professor
- [ ] Assistant Professor
- [ ] Instructor
- [ ] Other: Please specify. ("Other" categories may require prior approval. Students cannot serve as the PI)

## CO-INVESTIGATORS (CO-I)

- A Co-I is anyone who has responsibility for the project’s design, implementation, data collection, data analysis, or who has contact with study participants.
- If the project involves medical procedures or patient care that the PI is not certified or licensed to conduct, a responsible physician or other certified or licensed professional must be included as a Co-I. The application must include a copy of supporting documentation for this individual (CV, license, board certification etc.).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Study Role</th>
<th>Affiliation</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Email/Tel/Fax</th>
<th>Student (yes/no)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Michael J. Volk</td>
<td>Graduate Student</td>
<td>ASU</td>
<td>Mary Lou Fulton</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mjvolk@asu.edu">mjvolk@asu.edu</a></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## PROJECT FUNDING

1 a) How is the research project funded? (A copy of the grant application must be provided prior to IRB approval)

*Social Behavioral IRB Application Form – Page 1
Revised July 2010*
Research is **not funded** (Go to question 2)
- Funding decision is pending
- Research is **funded**

b) What is the source of funding or potential funding? (Check all that apply)
- Federal
- Private Foundation
- Subcontract
- Department Funds
- Fellowship
- Other

c) Please list the name(s) of the sponsor(s):

d) What is the grant number and title?

e) What is the ASU account number/project number?

f) Identify the institution(s) administering the grant(s):

---

**PROJECT SUMMARY**

2. Provide a brief description of the background, purpose, and design of your research. Avoid using technical terms and jargon. Describe all interactions with potential study participants (e.g., how identified, how recruited) including all of the means you will use to collect data (e.g., instruments, measures, tests, questionnaires, surveys, interview schedules, focus group questions, observations). Provide a short description of the tests, instruments, or measures. (If you need more than a few paragraphs, please attach additional sheets.) Attach copies of all instruments and questionnaires. **FOR ALL OF THE QUESTIONS, WRITE YOUR ANSWERS ON THE APPLICATION RATHER THAN SAYING “SEE ATTACHED”**.

"White Flight" has been well documented in urban city centers. However, this case study has investigated Garden City, Kansas, a rural community amidst a population influx of minorities. This population shift has increased the representation of Hispanic, Asian, and now Somali students in the public school system. This increase in minority enrollments in the Garden City Public School District has been accompanied by a dramatic decrease in White, Anglo students. This study attempts to identify the reasons for the exodus of White students from the public school setting.

I will attempt to interview approximately 10-15 citizens of Garden City, Kansas. With the help of my research committee I would like to interview school officials, municipal authorities, parents, and a few specialist that might include the local newspaper editor.

This case study will employ elements of both quantitative and qualitative research. The qualitative components of this study will yield information that will be interpreted and analyzed to help me gain a better understanding what is happening to the population of the Garden City Public School District. This will require some level of interpretation by the researcher that may be more heavily criticized (Stake, 1995). However, the usage of both qualitative and quantitative methodologies will give a balanced and accurate illustration of the circumstances of Garden City. To gain a better understanding of these questions I have consulted the methodological strategies used by May (2006) and Eckes (2006). For this study I will not conduct structured interviews as May (2006) did in her study. However, I have selected several questionnaires as an interview guide when constructing my own interview.
format (Rossman & Rallis, 2003). I will use a guided, semi-structured, open-ended interview platform patterned after the in-depth, phenomenological based interview (Seidman, 2006). For the purposes of this study I will shorten the three separate interviews recommended by Seidman (2006) into one 60-minute interview. Although I have shortened Seidman’s (2006) protocol, the three distinct interview stages will be present: primarily a focused life history, details of the experience, and reflection of the meaning. Standard protocols for selecting and conducting semi-structured interviews will be followed (Rossman & Rallis, 2003). Using mixed methods for this case study will only help to clarify and triangulate the data to help give clear and concise answers to the research questions which will be used to help guide my interviews:

- How do the local citizens react as more minority students start entering public schools in a traditionally White, secluded community?
- Do parents move to other rural communities that reflect demographics they are traditionally used to?
- Are students enrolling in other educational institutions including homeschooling and virtual schooling while they continue to reside in their community?
- Do citizens fight the influx of new immigrant workers or do they welcome them into their neighborhoods?
- As the diversity of Garden City increases, will behaviors emerge that reflect a migratory pattern of White flight?
- What are the impacts on the school system when large numbers of Hispanic students enroll?
- How have community members felt regarding the influx of migrant workers and their families?
- How do white students react when they are exposed to demographic shifts of their school population that exceed what the average White student sees?
- How do community members react when the student population of their local school shifts radically in ethnicity?
- How do White families react to increased inter-racial and inter-cultural interactions that they have limited dealings with?
- Are White community members afraid of the influx of Hispanic migratory workers and their families?
- What are the implications for other public school systems?
3. What is the expected duration of the study through data analysis? (Include a timeline, if applicable).

I anticipate the data collection process will last until April of 2011.

a. When is the expected date that you wish to begin research? (MM/DD/YY) 2/1/2011 (must be after submission date). Note: Protocols are approved for a maximum of 1 year. If a project is intended to last beyond the approval period, continuing review and reapproval are necessary. Research cannot begin until you have received an approval letter.

4. Has this project been reviewed by another IRB? ☐ Yes ☒ No (If yes, please complete the information below and attach a copy of the IRB approval materials).
   a) What is the name of the institution?

b) What is the current IRB approval date/status of IRB application? Not approved

5. Where will the study be conducted? (Check all that apply)
   ☐ On campus (Please indicate building(s) and room number(s) when known)
   ☒ Off campus (Please provide location and letter of permission, where applicable) I will be conducting a case study in Lexington, Nebraska. I will interview adults that are 18 years of age and older. I do not anticipate gaining any special permission from any institutions.

6a) What is the expected number of individuals to be screened for enrollment? I hope to interview between 10-15 individuals.

b) What is the Maximum number of subjects that you plan to enroll in the study? 15

c) What is the approximate number of: 7 Males 8 Females

d) Indicate the age range of the participants that you plan to enroll in your study: 18 to ?

e) What is the expected duration of participation for each subject? (at each contact session and total) 1 - 60 minute interview.

7. Will the study involve any of the following participants? (Please check all that apply if your study specifically targets these populations)
   ☐ Children (under 18) ☐ Pregnant women
   ☐ Prisoners or detainees ☐ Persons at high risk of becoming detained or imprisoned
   ☐ Decisionally impaired ☐ Patients- what is the status of their health?
   ☐ Fetus ☐ Native Americans
   ☒ Non-English speakers (Include copy of all materials in language of participants and certification of the translation and back-translation: http://researchintegrity.asu.edu/humans/forms)

Social Behavioral IRB Application Form – Page 4
Revised July 2010
a) If any of the above categories have been checked, please state how you will protect the rights and privacy of these individuals.

It is possible that one or more of my interviewees speaks English as a second language. No interviews will be conducted in Spanish, but only English. I will ensure that no names or identifiable characteristics, or titles are used to jeopardize the confidentiality and trust study participants have placed with me.

b) Please provide the rationale for the choice of the subjects including any inclusion criteria.

The choice of the subjects is directly related to the purpose of the case study, which is the population shift within the school population and how that has affected the White enrollment. For this purpose I will interview school officials that have dealt with the population shift. I would also like to interview municipal leaders, parents, and the local newspaper which has accumulated substantial documentation over the last ten years.

c) Will any ethnic/racial or gender groups be excluded from this study? If so, provide the rationale for the exclusion criteria.

I will primarily seek to interview the above-mentioned individuals. At this point, I am not aware of the races or genders of the individuals whom I wish to interview. I will not purposefully exclude any ethnic/race or gender groups willingly.

---

**RECRUITMENT**

8. Describe the process(es) you will use to recruit participants and inform them about their role in the study. (Attach copies of any recruitment materials.)

A conference over the telephone will take place where in I ask the candidate if I can set up an interview date and time. Before I arrive I will have mailed out my consent form for their participation in my case study.

a) Will any of the following be used? (Check all that apply and attach copies)

- ☒ Internet/Email
- ☐ Newspapers/radio/television advertising
- ☐ Posters/brochures/letters
- ☐ Other

---

**DECEPTION**

9. Does the proposed research require that you deceive participants in any way? ☒ Yes ☐ No

a) If your response is “yes,” describe the type of deception you will use, indicate why it is necessary for this study, and provide a copy of the debriefing script.

---

**COMPENSATION**

10. Will any type of compensation be used? (e.g. money, gift, raffle, extra credit, etc)

a) ☒ Yes (Please describe what the compensation is) ☐ No (go to question 11)

b) Explain why the compensation is reasonable in relation to the experiences of and burden on participants.
c) Is compensation for participation in a study or completion of the study? (Note: participants must be free to quit at any time without penalty including loss of benefits).
  ☐ Participation ☐ Completion

d) If any of the participants are economically disadvantaged, describe the manner of compensation and explain why it is fair and not coercive.

INFORMED CONSENT
11. Describe the procedures you will use to obtain and document informed consent and assent. Attach copies of the forms that you will use. In the case of secondary data, please attach original informed consent or describe below why it has not been included. Fully justify a request for a waiver of written consent or parental consent for minors.
(The ASU IRB website has additional information and sample consent and assent forms.)

INFORMATION LETTER-INTERVIEWS

Dear ____________________:

I am a graduate student under the direction of Professor Gene V Glass in the Mary Lou Fulton College of Education at Arizona State University. I am conducting a research study to try and determine why the White student enrollment in Garden City Public Schools has declined over the last thirty years.

I am inviting your participation, which will involve one 60-minute interview. During this interview we will discuss your views on the topic. You have the right not to answer any question, and to stop the interview at any time.

Your participation in this study is voluntary. If you choose not to participate or to withdraw from the study at any time, there will be no penalty, and all participants will be 18 years or older.

There are no foreseeable risks or discomforts to your participation. There is no benefit to you for participating in this case study.

Your responses will be confidential. Your name or job title will not be used in any way. The results of this study may be used in reports, presentations, or publications but your name will not be used. Transcripts of your interview will be stored in a locked filing cabinet and subsequently shredded after the research study has concluded.

I would like to audiotape this interview. The interview will not be recorded without your permission. Please let me know if you do not want the interview to be taped; you also can change your mind after the interview starts, just let me know. The recording of your interview will be stored on my office computer until a paper transcript has been produced, at which time the recording will be deleted.

If you have any questions concerning the research study, please contact the research team headed by Dr. Gene V Glass at glass@asu.edu. If you have any questions about your rights as a subject/participant in this research, or if you feel you have been placed at risk, you can contact the Chair of the Human Subjects Institutional Review Board, through the ASU Office of...
Research Integrity and Assurance, at (480) 965-6788. Please let me know if you wish to be part of the study.

Sincerely,

Michael J. Volk
mjvolk@asu.edu

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RISKS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12. What are the potential risks of the research? (Check all that apply)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Physical harm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Psychological harm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Release of confidential information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Other</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a) Describe any potential risks to human subjects and the steps that will be taken to reduce the risks. Include any risks to the subject’s well-being, privacy, emotions, employability, criminal, and legal status.

The results of this research study may be used in reports, presentations, and publications, but the researcher will not identify any candidates. I will not use any identifying names. Subject codes will be utilized if it is necessary to become more detailed in my report. Audio recordings of interviews will be erased once the transcripts have been produced. These transcripts will remain in a locked filing cabinet. The researcher is the only person who has keys to access this cabinet.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BENEFITS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13a) What are the potential benefits to the individual subject, if any, as a result of being in the study?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No known benefits for the subjects at this time.

b) What are the potential benefits, if any, to others from the study?

The possible benefits in the research may lead to further research on parental choice.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATA USE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14. How will the data be used? (Check all that apply)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☒ Dissertation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Thesis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Results released to participants/parents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Results released to agency or organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Other (please describe):</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Publication/journal article</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Undergraduate honors project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Results released to employer or school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>☐ Conferences/presentations</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROTECTION OF CONFIDENTIALITY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15. Describe the steps you will take to ensure the confidentiality of the participants and data.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results of this research study may be used in reports, presentations, and publications, but the researcher will not identify specific individuals. I will not use any identifying names. Subject codes will be utilized if it is necessary to become more detailed in my report. Audio recordings of interviews will be erased once the transcripts have been produced. These transcripts will remain in a locked filing cabinet. The researcher is the only person who has keys to access this cabinet.
a) Indicate how you will safeguard data that includes identifying or potentially identifying information (e.g. coding).

Subject codes may be used to protect individual privacy. I will secure all transcripts in a locked cabinet and erase all audio interviews once the transcripts have been produced.

b) Indicate when identifiers will be separated or removed from the data. Not sure how to answer this

c) Will the study have a master list linking participants’ identifying information with study ID codes, and thereby, their data? If so, provide a justification for having a master list. (Note: In many cases, the existence of a master list is the only part of a study that raises it above minimal risk, that is, places participants at risk.)

A master list will not be kept.

d) If you have a master list and/or data with identifiers, where on campus will the list and/or data be kept? (Data sets with identifiers and master lists, whether electronic or in hard copy, should be securely stored on an ASU campus except in unusual circumstances (e.g., research conducted out of the state or country).)

e) If you have a master list, when will it be destroyed?

f) How long do you plan to retain the data?

The data will be kept long enough to fulfill the graduation requirements to receive my doctorate degree. After I have satisfied the graduation requirements and those of my dissertation committee the transcripts will be destroyed and other sensitive data will be disposed of.

g) How will you dispose of the data?

Transcripts will be shredded along with other sensitive information.

h) Where on campus will you store the signed consent, assent, and parental permission forms (If applicable)? (Consent, assent, and parent permission forms should be securely stored on an ASU campus)

I have obtained permission from Dr. Arnold Danzig. He has allowed me to store the required documents in his office.

INVESTIGATOR INTERESTS

16 Have all investigator filed a current annual conflict of interest questionnaire with the ASU Office of Research Integrity and Assurance? It is the COEUS module at: http://researchintegrity.asu.edu/coi

☐ Yes ☒ No

a) Do any of the researchers or their family members, have a financial interest in a business which owns a technology to be studied and/or is sponsoring the research? ☐ Yes ☒ No (If yes, please describe and disclose in the consent form.)
b) Are there any plans for commercial development related to the findings of this study?
   ☐ Yes  ☒ No (If yes, please describe.)

c) Will the investigator or a member of the investigator’s family financially benefit if the findings are commercialized?
   ☐ Yes  ☐ No (If yes, please describe.)

d) Will participants financially benefit if the findings are commercialized?
   ☐ Yes  ☐ No (If yes, please describe.)

BIOLOGICAL MATERIALS

17a) Will biological materials be collected from subjects or given to subjects? ☐ Yes  ☒ No (If no, please skip to question 18)

b) Provide a description of the material (blood, tissue, vectors, antibodies, etc.) that will be used:

c) If the study involves human blood, do you have the required ASU Biosafety disclosure on file? ☐ Yes  ☒ No (If yes, what is the Biosafety Disclosure number.)

d) Will any of the material being used in the study come from a third party? ☐ Yes  ☒ No (If yes, attach copy of the Material Transfer Agreement if required.)

e) Does this study involve transfer of genetic material of animal tissue into humans? ☐ Yes  ☒ No (If yes, please cite the ASU Institutional Biosafety Disclosure number.)

TRAINING

18. The research team must document completion of human subjects training from within the past 3 years. (For more information see: http://researchintegrity.asu.edu/training-humans)

Please provide the date that the PI and co-investigators completed the training and attach the certificate.

PRINCIPAL INVESTIGATOR

In making this application, I certify that I have read and understand the ASU Procedures for the Review of Human Subjects Research and that I intend to comply with the letter and spirit of the University Policy. Changes in the study will be submitted to the IRB for written approval prior to these changes being put into practice. I also agree and understand that informed consent/assent records of the participants will be kept for at least three (3) years after the completion of the research. Attach a copy of the PI’s CV unless one is already on file with the Office of Research Integrity and Assurance.

Name (first, middle initial, last):
Gene V Glass

Signature: Date: 11/29/2010

FOR OFFICE USE: This application has been reviewed by the Arizona State University IRB:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Full Board Review</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expedite Categories:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exempt Categories:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Approved</td>
<td>Deferred</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project requires review more often than annual</td>
<td>Every</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Signature of IRB Chair/Member:</td>
<td>Date:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX C

PHOTOGRAPHS OF GARDEN CITY